

***Japan - Measures Affecting
Consumer Photographic Film and Paper
Report of the Panel***

The report of the Panel on Japan - Measures Affecting Consumer Photographic Film and Paper is being circulated to all Members, pursuant to the DSU. The report is being circulated as an unrestricted document from 20 March 1998 pursuant to the Procedures for the Circulation and Derestriction of WTO Documents (WT/L/160/Rev.1). Members are reminded that in accordance with the DSU only parties to the dispute may appeal a panel report, an appeal shall be limited to issues of law covered in the panel report and legal interpretations developed by the panel, and that there shall be no *ex parte* communications with the panel or Appellate Body concerning matters under consideration by the panel or Appellate Body.

Note by the Secretariat: This Panel Report shall be adopted by the Dispute Settlement Body (DSB) within 60 days after the date of its circulation unless a party to the dispute decides to appeal or the DSB decides by consensus not to adopt the report. If the Panel Report is appealed to the

WT/DS44/R

Page ii

Appellate Body, it shall not be considered for adoption by the DSB until after the completion of the appeal. Information on the current status of the Panel Report is available from the WTO Secretariat.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
I. PROCEDURAL HISTORY	1
II. SUMMARY OF FACTUAL ASPECTS	4
A. THE MARKET FOR PHOTOGRAPHIC FILM AND PAPER IN JAPAN	4
B. JAPANESE ENTITIES AND MEASURES RELATED TO THE US CLAIMS	5
1. <i>1967 CABINET DECISION</i>	5
2. <i>MITI AND RELATED ITEMS</i>	8
(a) Industrial Structure Council Distribution Committee: Sixth and Seventh Interim Reports	8
(i) The 1968 Sixth Interim Report	9
(ii) The 1969 Seventh Interim Report	10
(b) 1969 Survey on Transaction Terms	11
(c) 1970 Guidelines for Rationalizing Terms of Trade for Photographic Film	12
(d) 1971 Basic Plan of the Distribution Systemization Promotion Council	14
(e) 1975 Manual of the Distribution Systemization Development Centre	15
(f) Large Stores Law	16
(g) Japan Development Bank and the Small and Medium-Sized Enterprise Agency	17
3. <i>JFTC</i>	17
(a) Antimonopoly Law	18
(i) JFTC Rule No. 1 under Article 6 of the Antimonopoly Law	18
(ii) JFTC Notification 34 of 1971 (open lotteries)	18
(iii) JFTC Notification 15 of 1982	19
(b) Premiums Law	19
(i) JFTC Notification of 1965	21
(ii) JFTC Notification 17 of 1967	21
(iii) JFTC Notification 34 of 1973 (origin)	22
(iv) JFTC Notification 3 of 1977	23
(v) JFTC Notification 5 of 1977	24
(c) JFTC guidance	24
(i) 1981 JFTC guidance on dispatched employees	24
(ii) 1983 JFTC guidance on advertising rules	24
4. <i>COUNCILS AND ASSOCIATIONS</i>	25
(a) Fair Trade Promotion Council	25
(i) 1982 Self-Regulation Measures (dispatch of employees and promotional money)	25
(ii) 1984 Self-Regulating Standards (developing fees)	26
(b) Retailers Council and 1987 Retailers Code	27
(c) Chambers of Commerce and Industry	27
III. SUMMARY OF CLAIMS AND PROCEDURAL OBJECTIONS	28

A.	EVOLUTION OF THE US CLAIMS	28
B.	PROCEDURAL OBJECTIONS	30
1.	<i>THE REQUEST FOR CONSULTATIONS AND THE CONSULTATIONS</i>	31
2.	<i>THE REQUEST FOR THE ESTABLISHMENT OF THE PANEL</i>	36
(a)	Adequate notice	38
(b)	Related measures	39
(c)	Nature of the measures	41
IV.	SUMMARY OF ARGUMENTS	42
A.	DISTRIBUTION "COUNTERMEASURES"	42
B.	LARGE STORES LAW	44
C.	PROMOTION "COUNTERMEASURES"	45
D.	THE COMBINED EFFECT OF THE THREE SETS OF MEASURES	46
V.	FACTUAL ARGUMENTS OF THE PARTIES	48
A.	DISTRIBUTION "COUNTERMEASURES"	48
1.	<i>OVERVIEW</i>	48
2.	<i>DEVELOPMENT OF THE JAPANESE FILM MARKET</i>	49
3.	<i>NEED FOR PRIMARY WHOLESALERS IN THE JAPANESE FILM MARKET</i>	55
(a)	The US allegations about the market situation in the film distribution sector	55
(b)	No government obstacles to use or creation of primary wholesalers	56
(c)	The role of Nagase and Kodak Japan	59
(d)	Single brand distribution does not impede access of imports	60
(e)	The market for paper	62
(f)	Other film markets	64
4.	<i>THE RESTRUCTURING OF THE JAPANESE FILM DISTRIBUTION SECTOR</i>	64
(a)	The origin of MITI's distribution policies in the early 1960s	64
(b)	The 1967 Cabinet Decision	67
(c)	The 1968 Sixth Interim Report	68
(d)	The 1969 Seventh Interim Report and the Distribution Systemization Promotion Council	69
(e)	The 1971 Basic Plan	72
(f)	Vertical integration	72
(g)	Single-brand distribution	73
5.	<i>THE STANDARDIZATION OF TRANSACTION TERMS</i>	75
(a)	Introduction	75
(b)	1970 Guidelines	78
(i)	Impact of the Guidelines	80
(ii)	Timing	83
(c)	1990 Guidelines	84
6.	<i>OTHER DISTRIBUTION "COUNTERMEASURES"</i>	86
(a)	JFTC Notification 17	86

	(b)	International contract notification	87
7.		<i>SYSTEMIZATION: PHYSICAL AND INFORMATION LINKS</i>	89
	(a)	Physical links and the 1975 Manual	89
	(b)	Information links	91
	(c)	MITI/SMEA support for systemization	93
8.		<i>POST-1975 DEVELOPMENTS</i>	95
B.		<i>LARGE STORES LAW</i>	97
	1.	<i>INTRODUCTION</i>	97
	2.	<i>LARGE STORES AND IMPORTS</i>	99
		(a) Import-friendliness of large stores	99
		(b) Large stores and direct sales from manufacturers	101
		(c) Large stores and imported film	102
	3.	<i>BACKGROUND AND PURPOSE OF THE LARGE STORES LAW</i>	105
	4.	<i>PROCEDURES UNDER THE LARGE STORES LAW</i>	109
	5.	<i>EVOLUTION OF THE REGULATION OF LARGE STORES</i>	111
		(a) Department Stores Law	111
		(b) Enactment of the Large Stores Law	113
		(c) 1979 Revisions to the Large Stores Law	114
		(d) 1982 Administrative measures under the Large Stores Law	115
		(e) Restrictions on acquisitions	116
		(f) Changes to the law since 1990	117
	6.	<i>FORMAL AND INFORMAL ADJUSTMENTS</i>	119
		(a) Adjustments under formal procedures	119
		(b) Continued effect of local measures	121
		(c) Informal procedures under the Large Stores Law	123
		(i) "Prior explanations"	123
		(ii) "Local explanations"	124
		(iii) Large Store Council Review	125
	7.	<i>IMPACT OF FLOOR SPACE ADJUSTMENTS AND RESTRICTIONS ON OPERATION ON THE GROWTH OF LARGE STORES</i>	126
C.		<i>PROMOTION "COUNTERMEASURES"</i>	130
	1.	<i>INTRODUCTION</i>	130
	2.	<i>THE LAWS UNDERLYING THE PROMOTION "COUNTERMEASURES"</i>	131
		(a) The Antimonopoly Law	131
		(b) The Premiums Law	133
		(i) Background and objective	134
		(ii) Substantive provisions	136
		(iii) Enforcement	138
		(iv) Exemptions from the Antimonopoly Law	140
	3.	<i>INITIAL IMPLEMENTATION OF THE ANTIMONOPOLY AND PREMIUMS LAW</i>	140
	4.	<i>GENESIS OF THE PROMOTION "COUNTERMEASURES"</i>	142
	5.	<i>POST-KENNEDY ROUND PROMOTION "COUNTERMEASURES"</i>	145
		(a) JFTC Notification 17 of 1967 (premiums to businesses)	145
		(b) 1967 Cabinet Decision (guidance on fair competition codes)	147
		(c) JFTC Notification 34 of 1971 (open lotteries)	150
		(d) JFTC Notification 34 of 1973 (country of origin of goods)	150
		(e) JFTC Notification 3 of 1977 ("closed" prizes)	152
		(f) JFTC Notification 5 of 1977 (premiums to consumers)	152
	6.	<i>POST-TOKYO ROUND PROMOTION "COUNTERMEASURES"</i>	153

	(a)	JFTC guidance on the use of dispatched employees.....	153
	(b)	1982 Self-Regulating Measures (dispatch of employees) and the Promotion Council.....	154
	(c)	JFTC guidance on dumping and loss-leader advertising.....	157
	(d)	1984 Self-Regulating Standards (developing fees).....	157
	(e)	JFTC approval of 1987 Retailers Code and Retailers Council.....	158
7.		<i>SUBSEQUENT ENFORCEMENT</i>	162
VI.		LEGAL ARGUMENTS CONCERNING NON-VIOLATION CLAIMS.....	164
A.		INTRODUCTION TO ARTICLE XXIII:1(b) OF GATT.....	164
	1.	<i>GENERAL PRINCIPLES</i>	164
	2.	<i>THE LEGAL TEST UNDER ARTICLE XXIII:1(b)</i>	165
	3.	<i>SYSTEMIC IMPLICATIONS FOR WTO DISPUTE SETTLEMENT</i>	169
	4.	<i>REMEDIES</i>	174
B.		RELEVANT TARIFF CONCESSIONS.....	175
	1.	<i>GENERAL CONSIDERATIONS</i>	175
	2.	<i>PAST GATT PANEL REPORTS</i>	177
	3.	<i>THE TYPES OF TARIFF NEGOTIATIONS UNDER GATT</i>	179
	(a)	Article XXVIII.....	179
	(b)	Article XXIV:6.....	180
	(c)	Article XXVIII <i>bis</i>	181
	4.	<i>THE INCORPORATION CLAUSE OF GATT 1994</i>	183
	5.	<i>CERTIFICATION OF MODIFICATIONS AND RECTIFICATIONS</i>	185
	6.	<i>CONCLUSIONS</i>	186
C.		GOVERNMENTAL MEASURES.....	187
	1.	<i>THE LEGAL TEST</i>	187
	(a)	Administrative guidance.....	188
	(b)	Past GATT panel reports.....	190
	(c)	Governmental attributability of measures.....	193
	(d)	Measures "applied" and measures "in effect".....	195
	(e)	Measures and market structure.....	198
	2.	<i>DISTRIBUTION "COUNTERMEASURES"</i>	199
	(a)	Attributability to the government.....	200
	(i)	1970 Guidelines: background, publication and follow-up.....	202
	(ii)	1975 Manual.....	208
	(b)	Current effectiveness.....	209
	(i)	Reports, surveys, plans and manuals.....	209
	(ii)	JDB/SMEA funding and international contract notification.....	209
	(iii)	1967 JFTC Notification 17.....	209
	(iv)	1967 Cabinet Decision.....	210
	(v)	1970 Guidelines and 1990 Guidelines.....	210
	(vi)	Conclusions.....	213
	3.	<i>PROMOTION "COUNTERMEASURES"</i>	215
	(a)	The Councils and Codes.....	215
	(i)	Manufacturers' Council.....	216
	(ii)	Wholesalers' Council.....	216
	(iii)	Promotion Council.....	217
	(iv)	Retailers' Council.....	218
	(v)	Federation of Fair Trade Councils.....	219

	(b)	Attributability to the government	220
	(i)	Fair Competition Codes	220
	(ii)	Fair Trade Councils	221
	(iii)	Conclusions	223
D.		UPSETTING THE COMPETITIVE POSITION OF IMPORTED PRODUCTS	226
	1.	<i>THE LEGAL TEST</i>	226
	(a)	Measures, trade effects and market structure	228
	(b)	Causal connection	232
	(c)	Relevance of the time of the tariff concession	234
	2.	<i>OVERVIEW OF THE IMPACT OF SPECIFIC MEASURES ON THE COMPETITIVE POSITION OF IMPORTS</i>	235
	3.	<i>DISTRIBUTION "COUNTERMEASURES"</i>	238
	(a)	Evolution of systemization, rationalization and standardization of distribution policies	239
	(b)	Objectives underlying the introduction of transaction terms	241
	(c)	Competitive position of imported products	244
	(i)	1970 Guidelines and transaction terms	244
	(ii)	1970 Guidelines and progressive rebates	246
	(iii)	1970 Guidelines and single-brand distribution	248
	(iv)	Other distribution measures	250
	(v)	Black and white film and paper	250
	(d)	Causal connection between distribution measures and competitive position of imports	251
	(i)	Introduction of transaction terms	252
	(ii)	Introduction of single-brand distribution	253
	(iii)	Governmental endorsement of private actions	255
	(iv)	Downstream standardization	255
	(v)	Uniformity and standardization	256
	(e)	Financing for rationalization, systemization and standardization	257
	(i)	JDB funding for joint distribution facilities	257
	(ii)	SMEA loans to photoprocessing laboratories	258
	(f)	Electronic information links	260
	(g)	Current competitive position of imports	263
	(i)	Primary and secondary wholesale channels	264
	(ii)	Current market structure in the distribution system	265
	(iii)	Vertically integrated distribution system	267
	(iv)	Alternative distribution policies	268
	(h)	Change in distribution policies	269
	(i)	1990 Guidelines	270
	(ii)	Business Reform Law	270
	4.	<i>RESTRICTIONS ON LARGE RETAIL STORES</i>	271
	(a)	General overview of the allegations	271
	(b)	Effect of the Large Stores Law on imported products	274
	(c)	Causal connection	277
	(d)	Change in policies or continued restrictions of large stores	279
	(e)	Conclusions	282
	5.	<i>PROMOTION "COUNTERMEASURES"</i>	283
	(a)	General overview	283
	(b)	JFTC Notifications under the Premiums Law	284
	(i)	Competitive position of imports	284
	(ii)	Objectives underlying the promotion	

	"countermeasures"	286
	(iii) Causal connection	288
	(iv) Change in policies	289
(c)	Fair Trade Councils and Fair Competition Codes	290
	(i) Promotion Council	291
	(ii) Retailers' Council	292
	(iii) Coverage of photographic materials	293
(d)	Conclusions	294
E.	REASONABLE ANTICIPATION	295
	1. <i>THE LEGAL TEST</i>	295
	2. <i>SPECIFIC NEGOTIATING ROUNDS ON TARIFF CONCESSIONS</i>	301
	(a) General overview	301
	(b) Kennedy Round	302
	(i) Distribution "countermeasures"	303
	(ii) Restrictions on large stores	305
	(iii) Promotion "countermeasures"	305
(c)	Tokyo Round	306
	(i) Distribution "countermeasures"	306
	(ii) Restrictions on large stores	307
	(iii) Promotion "countermeasures"	309
(d)	Uruguay Round	311
	(i) Distribution "countermeasures"	312
	(ii) Restrictions on large stores	313
	(iii) Promotion "countermeasures"	315
F.	THE COMBINED EFFECT OF THE THREE SETS OF MEASURES	317
VII.	LEGAL ARGUMENTS CONCERNING VIOLATION CLAIMS	321
A.	ARTICLE III OF GATT	321
	1. <i>INTRODUCTION</i>	321
	2. <i>ARTICLE III:1</i>	323
	3. <i>ARTICLE III:4</i>	325
	(a) "Laws, regulations or requirements" within the scope of Article III:4	325
	(i) The legal test	325
	(ii) Japan's "administrative guidance" in the light of GATT precedents	327
	(iii) Are specific distribution measures "laws, regulations and requirements"?	329
	(iv) Measures "no longer in effect"	330
(b)	"Less favourable treatment" in the meaning of Article III:4	332
	(i) The legal test	332
	(ii) "Less favourable treatment" based on product origin or product characteristics	334
	(iii) Impact on competitive conditions for imported film and paper	336
	(iv) Causal connection	337
(c)	Causation of market structure by governmental measures or private practices	339
(d)	Conclusions	341
B.	ARTICLE X OF GATT	342

1.	<i>INTRODUCTION</i>	342
2.	<i>THE LEGAL TEST</i>	343
	(a) "Laws, regulations, judicial decisions or administrative rulings"	343
3.	<i>MEASURES TAKEN IN THE CONTEXT OF THE PREMIUMS LAW</i>	345
	(a) Premiums Law enforcement actions	345
	(b) Actions under "Fair Competition Codes"	347
	(c) Requests for information and disclosure of confidential information	348
4.	<i>MEASURES TAKEN IN THE CONTEXT OF THE LARGE STORES LAW</i>	349
	(a) MITI's "prior explanation" procedures	349
	(b) "Local explanation" procedures	349
	(c) Specific examples: The MCA and JFTC studies	351
	(d) Administrative rulings "made effective"	353
	(e) "Affecting the sale or distribution of imports"	353
5.	<i>CONCLUSIONS</i>	354
VIII.	ARGUMENTS OF THIRD PARTIES	355
A.	THE EUROPEAN COMMUNITIES	355
	1. <i>FACTUAL ASPECTS</i>	356
	2. <i>LEGAL ASPECTS</i>	358
	3. <i>ARGUMENTS IN REPLY BY JAPAN</i>	361
B.	MEXICO	362
IX.	INTERIM REVIEW	364
X.	FINDINGS	370
A.	PRELIMINARY ISSUES	370
	1. <i>SPECIFICITY OF THE "MEASURES" IDENTIFIED IN THE PANEL REQUEST</i>	371
	(a) Article 6.2 and the request for establishment of the Panel	371
	(b) Analysis of Article 6.2	372
	(c) The eight "measures" in light of Article 6.2	374
	2. <i>SUMMARY</i>	376
B.	CLAIMS OF THE PARTIES	377
C.	SEQUENCE OF CLAIMS TO BE ADDRESSED	378
D.	BURDEN OF PROOF	378
E.	ARTICLE XXIII:1(B) - NON-VIOLATION NULLIFICATION OR IMPAIRMENT	380
	1. <i>OVERVIEW OF THE NON-VIOLATION REMEDY</i>	380
	2. <i>THREE REQUIRED ELEMENTS</i>	382
	(a) Application of a measure	383
	(i) General considerations	383
	(ii) Governmental versus private actions	385
	(iii) Measure versus continuing effect	386

	(iv) Summary.....	387
	(b) Benefit accruing under the GATT.....	387
	(i) Benefits under successive Rounds.....	388
	(ii) Legitimate expectations of a benefit.....	391
	(c) Nullification or impairment of benefit: causality.....	394
3.	<i>DISTRIBUTION "MEASURES"</i>	396
	(a) General.....	396
	(b) 1967 Cabinet Decision.....	397
	(c) 1967 JFTC Notification 17 on premiums to businesses.....	400
	(d) 1968 Sixth Interim Report.....	403
	(e) 1969 Seventh Interim Report.....	407
	(f) 1969 Survey Report on Transaction Terms.....	411
	(g) 1970 Guidelines for Rationalizing Terms of Trade for Photographic Film.....	413
	(h) 1971 Basic Plan for the Systemization of Distribution.....	418
	(i) 1975 Manual for Systemization of Distribution by Industry: Camera and Film.....	421
	(j) Concluding observations on distribution "measures".....	425
4.	<i>RESTRICTIONS ON LARGE RETAIL STORES</i>	426
5.	<i>PROMOTION "MEASURES"</i>	432
	(a) 1967 Cabinet Decision.....	433
	(b) 1967 JFTC Notification 17 on premiums to business.....	437
	(c) 1977 JFTC Notification 5 on premium offers to consumers.....	440
	(d) 1981 JFTC Guidance on Dispatched Employees.....	443
	(e) 1982 Self-Regulating Measures on Fairness In Trade and Establishment of the Fair Trade Promotion Council.....	446
	(f) 1984 Self-Regulating Standards.....	452
	(g) 1987 The Retailers Fair Competition Code and the Retailers Council.....	454
	(h) Concluding observations on promotion "measures".....	462
6.	<i>COMBINED EFFECTS</i>	462
F.	ARTICLE III:4 - NATIONAL TREATMENT IN RESPECT OF LAWS, REGULATIONS AND REQUIREMENTS.....	467
	(a) Laws, regulations or requirements.....	468
	(b) No less favourable treatment.....	470
G.	ARTICLE X:1 - PUBLICATION OF ADMINISTRATIVE RULINGS OF GENERAL APPLICATION.....	471
	1. <i>GENERAL CONSIDERATIONS ON THE LEGAL TEST UNDER ARTICLE X:1</i>	472
	2. <i>"MEASURES" TAKEN IN THE CONTEXT OF THE PREMIUMS LAW</i>	473
	(a) Premiums Law enforcement actions.....	473
	(b) Actions under "Fair Competition Codes".....	474
	3. <i>"MEASURES" TAKEN IN THE CONTEXT OF THE LARGE STORES LAW</i>	475
H.	CONCLUSIONS.....	476
XI.	ANNEX ON TRANSLATION PROBLEMS	477
A.	LIST OF TRANSLATION ISSUES.....	477
	1. <i>APPENDIX TO TRANSLATION ISSUE 16</i>	485

2.	<i>APPENDIX TO TRANSLATION ISSUE 19</i>	492
B.	RESPONSES BY THE TRANSLATION EXPERTS	492