

## Contents (outline)

Foreword to the 1995–2013 edition	<i>page</i>	li
List of Abbreviations for Parts I and II		liv
<b>VOLUME 1</b>		
<b>Part I Appellate Body Reports</b>		<b>1</b>
A.0 Accession Protocols		3
A.1 Agreement on Agriculture		25
A.2 <i>Amicus Curiae</i> Briefs		108
A.3 Anti-Dumping Agreement		118
B.1 Balance-of-Payments Restrictions		318
B.2 Bilateral Agreements		319
B.3 Burden of Proof		320
B.4 Business Confidential Information		347
C.1 Claims and Arguments		368
C.2 Claims and Panel Reasoning		372
C.3 Competence of Panels and the Appellate Body		375
C.4 Completion of the Legal Analysis by the Appellate Body		381
C.5 Conditional Appeals		404
C.6 Confidentiality		406
C.7 Consultations		412
D.1 Directly Competitive or Substitutable Products		421
D.1A Dispute Settlement Body		426
D.2 Due Process		428
E.1 Enabling Clause		443
E.2 Environmental Multilateral Agreements		449
E.3 Evidence		451
G.1 GATS		478
G.2 GATT 1994		496
G.3 General Exceptions: Article XX of the GATT 1994		500
G.4 General Exceptions: Article XIV of the GATS		539
H.1 Harmonized System		547

---

I.0	Implementation Recommendations – Article 19.1 of the DSU	553
I.1	Inferences Drawn from the Refusal of a Party to Provide Information	561
I.2	International Monetary Fund – “Coherence”	563
I.3	Interpretation	565
J.1	Judicial Economy	615
J.2	Jurisdiction	626
L.0	Least-Developed Countries	634
L.1	Legislation as such vs. Specific Application	634
L.2	Licensing Agreement	645
L.3	Lomé Convention	647
M.1	Mandatory and Discretionary Legislation	648
M.2	MFN Treatment	654
M.3	Mootness of Panel Findings as a Consequence of Appellate Body Rulings	658
M.4	Multiple Complainants	664
M.5	Municipal Law	666
M.6	Mutually Agreed Solutions	676
N.1	National Treatment	678
N.2	Non-Violation Claims	725
N.3	Nullification or Impairment	727
O.1	Objections	730
O.2	Order of Analysis – Use of Assumptions	734
P.1	Panel Reports	744
P.2	Paris Convention (1967)	750
P.3	Principles and Concepts of General Public International Law	752
P.4	Private Counsel Participation in Dispute Settlement Proceedings	765
P.4A	Prompt Settlement of Disputes – Article 3.3 of the DSU	766
P.5	Publication and Administration of Trade Regulations	775
Q.1	Quantitative Restrictions	787
R.0	Recourse to the DSU for Violations of the Covered Agreements	792
R.1	Regional Trade Agreements	797
R.2	Request for the Establishment of a Panel	803
R.3	Retroactive Application of Trade Measures	836
R.4	Review of Implementation of DSB Rulings, Article 21.5 of the DSU	837
R.5	Right to Bring Claims – Legal Interest	884
R.6	Rules of Conduct	888
	<b>VOLUME 2</b>	
S.1	Safeguards Agreement	892
S.2	SCM Agreement	944
S.3	Scope of Appellate Review	1225
S.4	Seek Information and Technical Advice	1250
S.5	Special or Additional Rules and Procedures for Dispute Settlement	1259
S.6	SPS Agreement	1261

S.7	Standard of Review	1318
S.7A	State Trading Enterprises: Article XVII of the GATT 1994	1400
S.8	Status of Panel and Appellate Body Reports	1408
S.9	Suspension of Concessions or Other Obligations	1411
T.1	Tariff Concessions	1417
T.2	Tariff Quotas – Non-Discriminatory Administration	1436
T.3	Taxation	1441
T.4	TBT Agreement	1442
T.5	Temporal Application of Rights and Obligations	1501
T.6	Terms of Reference of Panels	1507
T.7	Textiles and Clothing Agreement	1541
T.8	Third Party Rights	1547
T.8A	TRIMs Agreement	1549
T.9	TRIPS Agreement	1554
W.1	Waivers	1567
W.2	Working Procedures for Appellate Review	1569
W.3	Working Procedures for Panels	1651
W.4	WTO Agreement	1654
	<b>Part II Arbitration Awards under Article 21.3(c) of the DSU</b>	<b>1659</b>
ARB.1	Mandate of Arbitrator under Article 21.3(c)	1661
ARB.2	Prompt Compliance	1666
ARB.3	Withdrawal or Modification of the Measure	1670
ARB.4	“Reasonable Period of Time”	1673
ARB.5	“Particular Circumstances”	1684
ARB.6	Burden of Proof	1734
	<b>Annexes</b>	
Annex A	Terms of Office of Current and Former Appellate Body Members and Chairpersons	1738
Annex B	Biographies of Current and Former Appellate Body Members	1740
Annex C	Information on Appellate Body Reports – 1996 to 2013	1753
Annex D	Arbitration Awards under Article 21.3(c) of the DSU – 1996 to 2013	1775
Annex E	Articles of Covered Agreements Addressed in Appellate Body Reports	1778
Annex F	Working Procedures for Appellate Review	1801
Annex G	Procedural Issues Related to Appellate Proceedings	1823
	Abbreviations used in the Table of References to the Covered Agreements and Other Instruments and in the Indexes	1832
	Table of References to the Covered Agreements and Other Instruments by Article	1833
	Subject Index	1850
	Subject Index by Case (Appellate Body Reports)	1953
	Subject Index by Case (Arbitration Awards under Article 21.3(c) of the DSU)	2115

# Contents (detail)

Foreword to the 1995–2013 edition	page	li
List of Abbreviations for Parts I and II		liv
<b>VOLUME 1</b>		
<b>Part I Appellate Body Reports</b>		<b>1</b>
<b>A</b>		<b>3</b>
<b>A.0 Accession Protocols</b>		<b>3</b>
A.0.1 China’s Accession Protocol		3
A.0.2 Relationship with other WTO agreements		8
A.0.3 Transitional safeguard mechanism. <i>See also</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Article 5 – Special safeguard (A.1.14); Safeguards Agreement, Article XIX of the GATT 1994 – General (S.1.45); Textiles and Clothing Agreement, Article 6 – Transitional safeguard (T.7.1)		13
Administrative Review of Countervailing Duty Measures <i>See</i> SCM Agreement, Article 21 (S.2.29–33)		25
Admission of Evidence. <i>See</i> Evidence (E.3)		25
Adverse Inferences Drawn from the Refusal of a Party to Provide Information. <i>See</i> Inferences Drawn from the Refusal of a Party to Provide Information (I.1)		25
<b>A.1 Agreement on Agriculture</b>		<b>25</b>
A.1.1 Article 1(a) and Annex 3 – “Aggregate Measurement of Support”		25
A.1.2 Article 1(a)(ii) and Annex 3 – “AMS commitments”		25
A.1.3 Article 1(e) – “subsidy”. <i>See also</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Relationship between the Agreement on Agriculture and the SCM Agreement (A.1.38); SCM Agreement, Articles 1.1 and 1.2 (S.2.2–S.2.10A)		26
A.1.4 Article 1(e) – “contingent upon export performance”		27
A.1.4A Article 3.1 – “export subsidy commitments”		28
A.1.4B Article 3.1 – “commitments limiting subsidization”		28
A.1.5 Article 3.3 – “export subsidies”		29
A.1.5A Article 3.3 – “budgetary outlay and quantity commitment levels”		29
A.1.6 Articles 3.3 and 10.1 – “export subsidy commitments”		31
A.1.7 Article 4 – “market access”		32

A.1.8	Article 4.1 – Market access commitments contained in schedules. <i>See also</i> Tariff Quotas – Non-Discriminatory Administration (T.2)	32
A.1.9	Article 4.2 and Footnote 1 – Conversion of certain border measures into ordinary customs duties	33
A.1.10	Article 4.2 and Footnote 1 – Measures of the kind	34
A.1.11	Article 4.2 and Footnote 1 – Minimum import price	36
A.1.12	Article 4.2 and Footnote 1 – Similar border measures other than ordinary customs duties	38
A.1.13	Article 4.2 and Footnote 1 – Variable import levies	40
A.1.14	Article 5 – Special safeguard. <i>See also</i> Accession Protocols, Transitional safeguard mechanism (A.0.3); Safeguards Agreement, Article XIX of the GATT 1994 – General (S.1.45)	44
A.1.14A	Article 6.3 – Domestic support commitments	46
A.1.14B	Article 8 – “export competition commitments”	46
A.1.14C	Article 9.1 – “export subsidies” Article 9.1 – Relationship with Article 10.1. <i>See</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Article 10.1 – Relationship with Article 9.1 (A.1.33)	47
A.1.14D	Article 9.1 – “subject to reduction commitments”	47
A.1.15	Article 9.1(a) – “direct subsidies, including payments-in-kind”	48
A.1.16	Article 9.1(a) – “governments or their agencies”	48
A.1.16A	Article 9.1(a) – “contingent on export performance”	49
A.1.17	Article 9.1(c) – “payments”	49
A.1.18	Article 9.1(c) – Benchmark for payments-in-kind	51
A.1.19	Article 9.1(c) – Benchmark – World market prices vs. Domestic prices	53
A.1.20	Article 9.1(c) – Benchmark – Cost of production	53
A.1.21	Article 9.1(c) – Industry-wide vs. Individual standard	58
A.1.22	Article 9.1(c) – “imputed” costs	58
A.1.23	Article 9.1(c) – Selling and quota costs	59
A.1.24	Article 9.1(c) – “governmental action”	60
A.1.25	Article 9.1(c) – Governmental action vs. Private action. <i>See also</i> SCM Agreement, Article 1.1(a)(1) – “public body” (S.2.3A); SCM Agreement, Article 1.1(a)(1)(iv) – Payments to a funding mechanism, entrustment or direction to a private body (S.2.8)	61
A.1.26	Article 9.1(c) – “by virtue of”	62
A.1.27	Article 9.1(c) – “financed”	66
A.1.28	Article 9.1(c) – Cross-subsidization	68
A.1.29	Article 9.1(d) – “costs of marketing”	70
A.1.29A	Article 9.2 – Budgetary outlay and quantity commitment levels	70
A.1.29B	Article 10 – General	71
A.1.30	Article 10.1 – “export subsidy commitments”	71
A.1.31	Article 10.1 – “export subsidies” not listed in Article 9.1	72
A.1.32	Article 10.1 – Actual circumvention	72
A.1.32A	Article 10.1 – Threat of circumvention	74
A.1.32B	Article 10.1 – “non-commercial transactions”	77
A.1.33	Article 10.1 – Relationship with Article 9.1	78

A.1.33A	Article 10.2 – Export credit guarantees	78
A.1.34	Article 10.3 – Reversal of burden of proof. <i>See also</i> Burden of Proof, Reversal of (B.3.4)	82
A.1.34A	Article 10.3 – Relationship with Article 6.2 of the DSU	86
A.1.34B	Article 10.4 – “food aid”	86
A.1.34C	Article 13 – “due restraint” (peace clause). <i>See also</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Relationship between the Agreement on Agriculture and the GATT 1994 (A.1.37)	87
A.1.34C.1	Subparagraph (a) – Green box	87
A.1.34C.2	Subparagraph (b) – Interpretation	87
A.1.34C.3	Subparagraph (b) – Application	89
A.1.34C.4	Subparagraph (b) – “grant” vs. “decided”	91
A.1.34C.5	Subparagraph (b) – Calculation method	92
A.1.34D	Annex 2 – “green box”	92
A.1.34D.1	Paragraph 1 – “fundamental requirement”	92
A.1.34D.2	Paragraph 6 – “decoupled income support”	93
A.1.34D.3	Paragraph 11 – “structural adjustment assistance”	95
A.1.34E	Annex 3, paragraph 7 – Measures directed at <i>processors</i> benefitting <i>producers</i>	96
A.1.35	Annex 3, paragraph 8 – “market price support”	97
A.1.36	Relationship between domestic support and export subsidies disciplines	98
A.1.37	Relationship between the Agreement on Agriculture and the GATT 1994. <i>See also</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Article 13 – “due restraint” (peace clause) (A.1.34C); Tariff Concessions, Relationship between Members’ schedules and the Agreement on Agriculture (T.1.4)	99
A.1.37A	Relationship between the Agreement on Agriculture and the Modalities Paper	101
A.1.38	Relationship between the Agreement on Agriculture and the SCM Agreement. <i>See also</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Article 1(e) – “subsidy” (A.1.3); SCM Agreement, Article 3.1(a) – “except as provided in the Agreement on Agriculture” – Export subsidies (S.2.11); SCM Agreement, Article 3.1(b) – “except as provided in the Agreement on Agriculture” – Import substitution subsidies (S.2.14A)	102
	Agreement on Implementation of Article VI of the GATT 1994. <i>See</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement (A.3)	108
	Agreement on Import Licensing Procedures. <i>See</i> Licensing Agreement (L.2)	108
	Agreement on Safeguards. <i>See</i> Safeguards Agreement (S.1)	108
	Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement (S.2)	108
	Agreement on Technical Barriers to Trade. <i>See</i> TBT Agreement (T.4)	108
	Agreement on Textiles and Clothing. <i>See</i> Textiles and Clothing Agreement (T.7)	108
	Agreement on the Application of Sanitary and Phytosanitary Measures. <i>See</i> SPS Agreement (S.6)	108

Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights. <i>See</i> TRIPS Agreement (T.9)	108
Agreement on Trade-Related Investment Measures. <i>See</i> TRIMs Agreement (T.8A)	108
Allocation of Quotas and Tariff Quotas. <i>See</i> Tariff Quotas – Non-Discriminatory Administration (T.2)	108
<b>A.2 <i>Amicus Curiae</i> Briefs</b>	<b>108</b>
A.2.1 Briefs submitted by NGOs, associations, and individuals	108
A.2.2 Briefs submitted by WTO Members. <i>See also</i> Third Party Rights (T.8)	114
A.2.3 Additional procedure. <i>See also</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 16 – Process, Rule 16(1) – Adoption of additional procedures (W.2.6.1)	115
<b>A.3 <i>Anti-Dumping Agreement</i></b>	<b>118</b>
A.3.0 Object and purpose	118
Article 1. <i>See</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article VI of the GATT 1994 – Anti-dumping duties (A.3.65)	119
A.3.1 Article 2 – Intent and effect of dumping	119
A.3.1A Article 2 – The concepts of “dumping” and “margins of dumping”	119
A.3.2 Article 2 – Period of investigation	124
A.3.3 Article 2.1 – “normal value . . . in the ordinary course of trade”	124
A.3.4 Article 2.1 – Sales below cost	126
A.3.5 Article 2.1 – Calculation of normal value	126
A.3.6 Article 2.1 – Fair comparison	127
A.3.7 Article 2.1 – Volume of dumped imports	127
A.3.8 Article 2.1 – Relationship with other provisions of the Anti-Dumping Agreement. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 2.4.2 (A.3.14–14A); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 11.3 (A.3.45–52)	128
A.3.8A Article 2.2	129
A.3.9 Article 2.2.1 – Sales below cost and “ordinary course of trade”	129
A.3.9A Article 2.2.1.1 – “consider all available evidence on the proper allocation of costs”. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 2.4.2 – Calculation of margins of dumping – “zeroing” (A.3.14)	130
A.3.9B Article 2.2.1.1 – “reasonably reflect” the cost of production	131
A.3.10 Article 2.2.2 – Low volume sales and “ordinary course of trade”	131
A.3.11 Article 2.2.2(ii) – Calculation of “weighted average”	132
A.3.12 Article 2.4 – “fair comparison”	132
A.3.13 Article 2.4 – Calculation of dumping margins – Relationship with Article 11.3. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 11.3 (A.3.45–52)	136
A.3.13A Article 2.4 – Third sentence	136
A.3.14 Article 2.4.2 – Calculation of margins of dumping – “zeroing”. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 2.1 – Relationship with other provisions of the Anti-Dumping Agreement (A.3.8); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 2.2.1.1 – “consider all available evidence on the proper allocation of costs” (A.3.9A); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article VI of the GATT 1994 – Anti-dumping duties (A.3.65)	138

A.3.14A	Article 2.4.2 – Second sentence. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 2.1 – Relationship with other provisions of the Anti-Dumping Agreement (A.3.8)	151
A.3.15	Article 3.1 – General. <i>See also</i> SCM Agreement, Article 15 – Determination of injury (S.2.24A)	153
A.3.15A	Footnote 9 to Article 3	154
A.3.16	Article 3.1 – “positive evidence”	155
A.3.17	Article 3.1 – “objective examination”	157
A.3.18	Articles 3.1 and 3.2 – Method of calculating the “volume of the dumped imports”	159
A.3.19	Articles 3.1 and 3.2 – Calculation of the “volume of the dumped imports” without examining each producer or exporter individually. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 2.1 (A.3.3–8); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 3.3 – Cumulative assessment of dumped imports (A.3.21); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 3.5 – Individual vs. Collective effects of other factors (A.3.26); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 6.10 (A.3.37); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 9.4 (A.3.41–44)	160
A.3.20	Article 3.2 – Consideration of the volume of dumped imports and their effects on prices. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 3.3 – Cumulative assessment of dumped imports (A.3.21); SCM Agreement, Article 15.2 – Consideration of the volume of subsidized imports and their effects on prices (S.2.24B)	162
A.3.21	Article 3.3 – Cumulative assessment of dumped imports. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Articles 3.1 and 3.2 – Calculation of the “volume of the dumped imports” without examining each producer or exporter individually (A.3.19); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 3.2 – Consideration of the volume of dumped imports and their effects on prices (A.3.20); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 11.3 – Cumulation in sunset reviews (A.3.48A)	171
A.3.22	Article 3.4 – Evaluation of injury factors	173
A.3.23	Article 3.4 – Manner of evaluating injury factors	175
A.3.23A	Article 3.5 – Causation. <i>See also</i> Safeguards Agreement, Article 4.2(b) – Causation of injury by increased imports (S.1.29); SCM Agreement, Article 15.5 – Causation (S.2.25A)	176
A.3.24	Article 3.5 – Non-attribution of injury caused by other known factors. <i>See also</i> Safeguards Agreement, Article 4.2(b) – Non-attribution of injury caused by other factors; SCM Agreement, Article 15.5 – Causation (S.2.25A)	177
A.3.25	Article 3.5 – Examination of other known factors	180
A.3.26	Article 3.5 – Individual vs. Collective effects of other factors. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Articles 3.1 and 3.2 – Calculation of the “volume of the dumped imports” without examining each producer or exporter individually (A.3.19)	181
A.3.27	Article 3.7 – Threat of material injury. <i>See also</i> Safeguards Agreement, Article 4.1(b) – Threat of serious injury (S.1.24); SCM Agreement, Article 15.7 – Threat of material injury (S.2.25B)	183



A.3.27A	Article 4 – Definition of domestic industry. <i>See also</i> Safeguards Agreement, Article 4.1(c) – Domestic industry (S.1.25); Textiles and Clothing Agreement, Article 6.2 – “domestic industry” (T.7.3)	186
A.3.28	Article 5.4 – Motives of domestic producers for supporting investigation	189
A.3.28A	Article 5.8 – Termination of the investigation. <i>See also</i> SCM Agreement, Article 11.9 – Termination of an investigation (S.2.21)	190
A.3.28B	Article 5.10 – Time-limit for investigations	191
A.3.29	Article 6 – Evidentiary rules for anti-dumping investigations. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Articles 11.3 and 11.4 (A.3.51A–52, A.3.53); SCM Agreement, Article 12 (S.2.21B–S.2.21D)	191
A.3.30	Article 6.1. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 6.8 and Annex II – Timeliness of parties’ submissions (A.3.34); SCM Agreement, Article 12.1 – Notice of information required and opportunity to present evidence (S.2.21B)	192
A.3.30.1	Article 6.1 – “ample opportunity to present in writing all evidence”	192
A.3.30.2	Article 6.1 – Exporters to be given notice	197
A.3.31	Article 6.2 – Opportunity for interested parties to defend their interests. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 6.4 – Access to information relevant for interested parties to present their case (A.3.32)	198
A.3.32	Article 6.4 – Access to information relevant for interested parties to present their case. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 6.2 – Opportunity for interested parties to defend their interests (A.3.31); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 6.9 – Disclosure of essential facts prior to final determination (A.3.36A); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 12 – Public notice and explanation of determinations (A.3.53A)	201
A.3.32A	Article 6.5 – Confidential information	205
A.3.33	Article 6.8 and Annex II – Facts available to investigating authorities. <i>See also</i> SCM Agreement, Article 12.7 – Determinations on the basis of the facts available (S.2.21C)	209
A.3.34	Article 6.8 and Annex II – Timeliness of parties’ submissions. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 6.1 (A.3.30)	211
A.3.35	Article 6.8 and Annex II – “reasonable period” for submission of information	212
A.3.36	Article 6.8 and Annex II – Lack of cooperation by investigated parties. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 11.4 – Relationship with Article 6 (A.3.53)	213
A.3.36A	Article 6.9 – Disclosure of essential facts prior to final determination. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 6.4 – Access to information relevant for interested parties to present their case (A.3.32); SCM Agreement, Articles 12.8 and 12.9 – “Interested parties” and disclosure of essential facts (S.2.21D)	215
A.3.37	Article 6.10. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Articles 3.1 and 3.2 – Calculation of the “volume of the dumped imports” without examining each producer or exporter individually (A.3.19); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 9.2 – Imposition of anti-dumping duties in the appropriate amount and on a non-discriminatory basis, in respect of any product (A.3.40); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 9.3 – Margin of dumping (A.3.40A); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 11.4 – Relationship with Article 6 (A.3.53)	217

A.3.37.1	Article 6.10 – Known exporter or producer	217
A.3.37.2	Article 6.10 – Individual margins of dumping	218
A.3.38	Article 6.13 – Cooperation between interested parties and investigating authorities	222
A.3.38A	Article 7 – Provisional measures	222
A.3.39	Article 9 – Imposition of anti-dumping duties – General, Relationship with Articles 2 and 3	223
A.3.40	Article 9.2 – Imposition of anti-dumping duties in the appropriate amount and on a non-discriminatory basis, in respect of any product. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 6.10 (A.3.37); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 11.3 – No duty to investigate each known producer and exporter individually (A.3.50); SCM Agreement, Article 19.3 – Imposition of countervailing duties in the appropriate amounts and on a non-discriminatory basis (S.2.27)	226
A.3.40A	Article 9.3 – Margin of dumping. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 2 (A.3.1–14A); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 6.10 (A.3.37)	231
A.3.40B	Articles 9.3.1 and 9.3.2 – Prospective and retrospective duty assessment	236
A.3.40C	Footnote 20 to Article 9.3.1 of the Anti-Dumping Agreement	241
A.3.41	Article 9.4 – Calculation of the “all other” anti-dumping duty rate	242
A.3.41A	Article 9.4(ii) – Prospective normal value systems	242
A.3.42	Article 9.4 – Relationship with Article 2.4.2	245
A.3.43	Article 9.4 – Relationship with Article 6.8	245
A.3.44	Article 9.4 – Relationship with paragraphs 1 and 2 of Article 3	246
A.3.44A	Article 9.5 – New shipper reviews	247
A.3.44B	Articles 11.1 and 11.2 – Duration and review of anti-dumping duties	248
A.3.45	Article 11.3 – Sunset reviews – Conditions. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 11.4 – Relationship with Article 6 (A.3.53); SCM Agreement, Article 21 (S.2.29–S.2.33)	250
A.3.46	Article 11.3 – Likelihood of continuation or recurrence of dumping	252
A.3.47	Article 11.3 – Standard of review	253
A.3.47A	Article 11.3 – Nature of sunset reviews	255
A.3.48	Article 11.3 – Methodology for sunset reviews	256
A.3.48A	Article 11.3 – Cumulation in sunset reviews. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 3.3 – Cumulative assessment of dumped imports (A.3.21)	257
A.3.49	Article 11.3 – Relationship with Article 2. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 2 (A.3.1–14A)	260
A.3.50	Article 11.3 – No duty to investigate each known producer and exporter individually. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 11.4 – Relationship with Article 6 (A.3.53)	262
A.3.51	Article 11.3 – Determination of dumping margins and import volumes	263
A.3.51A	Article 11.3 – Evidence. <i>See also</i> Evidence (E.3)	265
A.3.52	Article 11.3 – Likelihood determination based on evidence vs. Presumptions	266
A.3.52A	Article 11.3 – Likelihood of continuation or recurrence of injury	271
A.3.52B	Article 11.3 – Relationship with Article 3	273

A.3.52C	Article 11.3 – Timeframe for likelihood of continuation or recurrence of injury	275
A.3.53	Article 11.4 – Relationship with Article 6. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement – Article 6 (A.3.29–38); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 11.3 – Sunset review – Conditions (A.3.45); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 11.3 – No duty to investigate each known producer and exporter individually (A.3.50); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 12 – Public notice and explanation of determinations (A.3.53A)	276
A.3.53A	Article 12 – Public notice and explanation of determinations	277
A.3.53B	Article 13 – Judicial Review. <i>See also</i> Publication and Administration of Trade Regulations, Article X:3 of the GATT 1994, Paragraph (b) – Independent judicial, arbitral or administrative review (P.5.3.2)	280
A.3.54	Article 17 – Consultation and Dispute Settlement. <i>See also</i> Special or Additional Rules and Procedures for Dispute Settlement (S.5)	281
A.3.55	Article 17.3 – Consultations. <i>See also</i> Consultations (C.7); Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1); Terms of Reference of Panels, Specific measures at issue (T.6.3)	281
A.3.56	Article 17.4 – “matter referred to the DSB”. <i>See also</i> Jurisdiction, General (J.2.1); Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6)	282
A.3.57	Article 17.5 – Facts made available to the investigating authority. <i>See also</i> Request for the Establishment of a Panel (R.2)	286
A.3.58	Article 17.6 – Standard of review under the Anti-Dumping Agreement. <i>See also</i> Standard of Review (S.7)	287
A.3.59	Article 17.6(i) – “assessment of the facts”. <i>See also</i> Seek Information and Technical Advice (S.4); Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU – Objective assessment of the facts (S.7.3)	289
A.3.60	Article 17.6(ii) – “permissible interpretations”. <i>See also</i> Interpretation (I.3); Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU – Objective assessment of the matter (S.7.2)	292
A.3.61	Article 18.1 – Specific action against dumping. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article VI of the GATT 1994 – Anti-dumping duties (A.3.65); Anti-Dumping Agreement, The <i>Ad Note</i> to Article VI:2 and 3 of the GATT 1994 – Reasonable security (A.3.66A); SCM Agreement, Article 32.1 – Specific action against a subsidy (S.2.36)	296
A.3.62	Article 18.4 – Obligation to ensure WTO-conformity of domestic anti-dumping laws, regulations and procedures. <i>See also</i> WTO Agreement, Article XVI:4 – WTO-conformity of laws, regulations and administrative procedures (W.4.3)	300
	Aggregate Investigations. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement, Article 19 (S.2.26–28)	301
A.3.63	Relationship between the Anti-Dumping Agreement and the SCM Agreement	301
	Relationship between the Anti-Dumping Agreement and the Safeguards Agreement. <i>See</i> Safeguards Agreement, Relationship between the Safeguards Agreement and the Anti-Dumping Agreement (S.1.43)	302
A.3.64	Relationship between the Anti-Dumping Agreement and the GATT 1994	302

A.3.65	Article VI of the GATT 1994 – Anti-dumping duties. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 2.4.2 – Calculation of margins of dumping – “zeroing” (A.3.14); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 18.1 – Specific action against dumping (A.3.61)	305
A.3.66	The <i>Ad Note</i> to Article VI:2 and 3 of the GATT 1994 – Pending final determination of the facts in any case of suspected dumping	311
A.3.66A	The <i>Ad Note</i> to Article VI:2 and 3 of the GATT 1994 – Reasonable security. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 18.1 – Specific action against dumping (A.3.61)	314
	Article VI:5 of the GATT 1994. <i>See</i> Article VI:5 of the GATT 1994 – Anti-dumping and countervailing duties and “double remedies” (S.2.44)	317
	Assumptions and use of <i>arguendo</i> reasoning. <i>See</i> Order of Analysis – Use of Assumptions (O.2)	317
	<b>B</b>	<b>318</b>
<b>B.1</b>	<b>Balance-of-Payments Restrictions. <i>See also</i> Jurisdiction, General (J.2.1)</b>	<b>318</b>
B.1.1	Article XVIII:11 of the GATT 1994, <i>Ad Note</i>	318
B.1.2	Article XVIII:11 of the GATT 1994, Proviso Benefit. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement, Article 1.1(b) – Conferral of a benefit on a recipient (S.2.9); SCM Agreement, Article 14 (S.2.22–24)	319
<b>B.2</b>	<b>Bilateral Agreements</b>	<b>319</b>
<b>B.3</b>	<b>Burden of Proof. <i>See also</i> Enabling Clause, Paragraph 1 (E.1.1); Evidence (E.3); Quantitative Restrictions, Exclusions from the scope of Article XI:1 – Article XI:2 of the GATT 1994 (Q.1.2); SCM Agreement, Article 27 – Special and differential treatment for developing country Members (S.2.35); Seek Information and Technical Advice (S.4); SPS Agreement, Article 3.2 – “measures which conform to international standards” (S.6.7); TBT Agreement, Annex 1.2 – Standards, General (T.4.2A.2); TBT Agreement, Annex 1.2 – Standards, Burden of proof (T.4.2A.3); TBT Agreement, Article 2.4 – International standards as a basis for technical regulation (T.4.3); Terms of Reference of Panels, Specific measures at issue (T.6.3)</b>	<b>320</b>
B.3.1	General. <i>See also</i> Claims and Arguments (C.1); Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1); Mandatory and Discretionary Legislation (M.1); Request for the Establishment of a Panel, Article 6.2 of the DSU – Claims and legal basis of the complaint (R.2.2); Terms of Reference of Panels, Claims and legal basis of the complaint (T.6.2)	320
B.3.2	Presumption – <i>Prima facie</i> case. <i>See also</i> Burden of Proof, Defences and exceptions (B.3.3)	328
B.3.3	Defences and exceptions. <i>See also</i> Burden of Proof, Presumption – <i>Prima facie</i> case (B.3.2)	336
B.3.4	Reversal of burden of proof. <i>See also</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Article 10.3 – Reversal of burden of proof (A.1.34)	344

B.3.5	“Post suspension of concessions”	346
<b>B.4</b>	<b>Business Confidential Information. <i>See also</i> Confidentiality (C.6); Evidence (E.3); Inferences Drawn from the Refusal of a Party to Provide Information (I.1); Seek Information and Technical Advice (S.4); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 8 – Rules of Conduct – Confidentiality (W.2.4); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 16 – Process, Rule 16(1) – Adoption of additional procedures (W.2.6.1); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 27 – Oral hearing, Open oral hearing (W.2.11.3)</b>	<b>347</b>
	<b>C</b>	<b>368</b>
<b>C.1</b>	<b>Claims and Arguments. <i>See also</i> Burden of Proof, General (B.3.1); Panel Reports, Basic rationale behind findings and conclusions (P.1.1); Request for the Establishment of a Panel (R.2); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 20 – Notice of Appeal (W.2.7)</b>	<b>368</b>
<b>C.2</b>	<b>Claims and Panel Reasoning. <i>See also</i> Order of Analysis – Use of Assumptions (O.2); Panel Reports, Basic rationale behind findings and conclusions (P.1.1); Request for the Establishment of a Panel, Article 6.2 of the DSU – Claims and legal basis of the complaint (R.2.2); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6)</b>	<b>372</b>
	Coherence. <i>See</i> International Monetary Fund – “Coherence” (I.2)	375
<b>C.3</b>	<b>Competence of Panels and the Appellate Body. <i>See also</i> Jurisdiction (J.2); Scope of Appellate Review (S.3); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6)</b>	<b>375</b>
C.3.1	Articles 3.2 and 11 of the DSU – Function of panels and the Appellate Body	375
C.3.2	Articles 3.2 and 19.2 of the DSU – “not add to or diminish rights and obligations”. <i>See also</i> Interpretation (I.3)	380
<b>C.4</b>	<b>Completion of the Legal Analysis by the Appellate Body. <i>See also</i> Conditional Appeals (C.5); Judicial Economy (J.1); Mootness of Panel Findings as a Consequence of Appellate Body Rulings (M.3); Prompt Settlement of Disputes – Article 3.3 of the DSU (P.4A); Scope of Appellate Review (S.3)</b>	<b>381</b>
	Compliance Panels. <i>See</i> Review of Implementation of DSB Rulings, Article 21.5 of the DSU (R.4)	404
<b>C.5</b>	<b>Conditional Appeals. <i>See also</i> Completion of the Legal Analysis by the Appellate Body (C.4); Scope of Appellate Review (S.3)</b>	<b>404</b>
<b>C.6</b>	<b>Confidentiality. <i>See also</i> Business Confidential Information (B.4); Consultations (C.7); Evidence (E.3); Inferences Drawn from the Refusal of a Party to Provide Information (I.1); Working Procedures for</b>	

	<b>Appellate Review, Rule 8 – Rules of Conduct – Confidentiality (W.2.4); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 16 – Process, Rule 16(1) – Adoption of additional procedures (W.2.6.1); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 27 – Oral hearing, Open oral hearing (W.2.11.3)</b>	<b>406</b>
<b>C.7</b>	<b>Consultations. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 17.3 – Consultations (A.3.55); Confidentiality (C.6)</b>	<b>412</b>
	Context. <i>See</i> Interpretation, Context (I.3.3)	420
	Customary Rules of Interpretation. <i>See</i> Interpretation (I.3)	420
	<b>D</b>	<b>421</b>
	Development. <i>See</i> Enabling Clause (E.1); SCM Agreement, Article 27 – Special and differential treatment for developing country Members (S.2.35)	421
<b>D.1</b>	<b>Directly Competitive or Substitutable Products. <i>See also</i> National Treatment, Article III:2 of the GATT 1994, second sentence – “directly competitive or substitutable” products (N.1.6); Textiles and Clothing Agreement, Article 6.2 – “directly competitive products” (T.7.4)</b>	<b>421</b>
	Discretionary and Mandatory Legislation. <i>See</i> Mandatory and Discretionary Legislation (M.1)	426
<b>D.1A</b>	<b>Dispute Settlement Body</b>	<b>426</b>
	DSB adoption or appeal of panel reports. <i>See</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Timing of an appeal (W.2.0)	427
	DSB initiation of an Annex V procedure. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement, Annex V – Procedures for Developing Information Concerning Serious Prejudice (S.2.40A)	427
	Dispute Settlement Understanding	427
	Article 1.2. <i>See</i> Special or Additional Rules and Procedures for Dispute Settlement (S.5)	427
	Article 3.2. <i>See</i> Competence of Panels and the Appellate Body (C.3); Interpretation (I.3)	427
	Article 3.3. <i>See</i> Prompt Settlement of Disputes – Article 3.3 of the DSU (P.4A). <i>See also</i> Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1); Review of Implementation of DSB Rulings, Article 21.5 of the DSU (R.4); Terms of Reference of Panels, Specific measures at issue (T.6.3)	427
	Article 3.4. <i>See</i> Implementation Recommendations – Article 19.1 of the DSU (I.0)	427
	Article 3.7. <i>See</i> Right to Bring Claims – Legal Interest (R.5); Suspension of Concessions or Other Obligations (S.9). <i>See also</i> Completion of the Legal Analysis by the Appellate Body (C.4); Judicial Economy (J.1); Mutually	

Agreed Solutions (M.6); Need to address each issue raised (Article 17.12 of the DSU) (S.3.4)	427
Article 3.8. <i>See</i> Burden of Proof, Presumption – <i>Prima facie</i> case (B.3.2); Nullification or Impairment (N.3)	427
Article 3.10. <i>See</i> Competence of Panels and the Appellate Body (C.3); Principles and Concepts of General Public International Law, Good faith – <i>Pacta sunt servanda</i> (P.3.1); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 20 – Notice of Appeal (W.2.7)	427
Article 4. <i>See</i> Consultations (C.7)	427
Article 6.2. <i>See</i> Request for the Establishment of a Panel (R.2); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6)	427
Article 7. <i>See</i> Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6)	427
Article 9. <i>See</i> Multiple Complainants (M.4); Panel Reports, Separate panel reports (P.1.3)	427
Article 10. <i>See</i> Third Party Rights (T.8); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 24 – Third participants (W.2.9)	427
Article 11. <i>See</i> Scope of Appellate Review, Review of “objective assessment” by the panel – Article 11 of the DSU (S.3.2); Standard of Review (S.7)	427
Article 12.1. <i>See</i> Terms of Reference of Panels, Claims and legal basis of the complaint (T.6.2)	428
Article 12.7. <i>See</i> Panel Reports, Basic rationale behind findings and conclusions (P.1.1)	428
Article 13. <i>See</i> Seek Information and Technical Advice (S.4); Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU (S.7.2–9)	428
Article 14. <i>See</i> Business Confidential Information (B.4); Confidentiality (C.6)	428
Article 15. <i>See</i> Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU (S.7.2–9)	428
Article 16.4. <i>See</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Timing of an appeal (W.2.0); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 20 – Notice of Appeal (W.2.7)	428
Article 17.4. <i>See</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 24 – Third participants (W.2.9)	428
Article 17.5. <i>See</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 26 – Working schedule, Timing of circulation of Appellate Body report (W.2.10.2)	428
Article 17.6. <i>See</i> Scope of Appellate Review (S.3)	428
Article 17.9. <i>See</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review (W.2); WT/AB/WP/6 (Annex F)	428
Article 17.10. <i>See</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 8 – Rules of conduct – Confidentiality (W.2.4)	428
Article 17.11. <i>See</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 3.2 – Concurring opinion – Article 17.11 of the DSU (W.2.3)	428

Article 17.12. <i>See</i> Scope of Appellate Review (S.3)	428
Article 17.13. <i>See</i> Scope of Appellate Review (S.3)	428
Article 17.14. <i>See</i> Review of Implementation of DSB Rulings, Article 21.5 of the DSU – Effect of DSB rulings in the original dispute (R.4.3)	428
Article 19.1. <i>See</i> Implementation Recommendations (I.0)	428
Article 19.2. <i>See</i> Competence of Panels and the Appellate Body (C.3)	428
Article 21.5. <i>See</i> Review of Implementation of DSB Rulings, Article 21.5 of the DSU (R.4)	428
Article 22. <i>See</i> Suspension of Concessions or Other Obligations (S.9)	428
Article 23. <i>See</i> Recourse to the DSU for Violations of the Covered Agreements (R.0), Suspension of Concessions or Other Obligations (S.9)	428
Article 24. <i>See</i> Least-Developed Countries (L.0)	428
Domestic Law. <i>See</i> Municipal Law (M.5)	428
<b>D.2 Due Process</b>	<b>428</b>
D.2.1 Due process in the application of trade measures	428
D.2.2 Due process in WTO dispute settlement proceedings. <i>See also</i> Request for the Establishment of a Panel (R.2); Rules of Conduct (R.6); Seek Information and Technical Advice (S.4); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6); Working Procedures for Appellate Review (W.2)	429
Duty of a Member to Comply with the Request of a Panel to Provide Information. <i>See</i> Inferences Drawn from the Refusal of a Party to Provide Information (I.1); Seek Information and Technical Advice (S.4)	442
<b>E</b>	<b>443</b>
<b>E.1 Enabling Clause. <i>See also</i> MFN Treatment (M.2)</b>	<b>443</b>
E.1.1 Paragraph 1. <i>See also</i> Burden of Proof (B.3); Request for the Establishment of a Panel, Article 6.2 of the DSU – Claims and legal basis of the complaint (R.2.2)	443
E.1.2 Paragraph 2(a)	444
E.1.3 Paragraph 2(d)	447
E.1.4 Paragraph 3(a)	447
E.1.5 Paragraph 3(c)	448
Enforcement of Intellectual Property Rights. <i>See</i> TRIPS Agreement, Article 42 – Civil and administrative procedures and remedies (T.9.10)	449
<b>E.2 Environmental Multilateral Agreements. <i>See also</i> General Exceptions: Article XX of the GATT 1994 (G.3)</b>	<b>449</b>
Establishment of a Panel. <i>See</i> Request for the Establishment of a Panel (R.2); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6)	451
<b>E.3 Evidence. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 11.3 – Evidence (A.3.51A); Burden of Proof (B.3); Business Confidential Information (B.4); Confidentiality (C.6); Inferences Drawn from the Refusal of a</b>	



	<b>Party to Provide Information (I.1); Seek Information and Technical Advice (S.4); Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU (S.7.2–9)</b>	<b>451</b>
E.3.1	Admissibility of evidence in panel proceedings	451
E.3.2	Panel’s review of evidence	456
E.3.3	Evidence in appellate proceedings	475
	Exceptions. <i>See</i> Burden of proof, Defences and exceptions (B.3.3); General Exceptions: Article XX of the GATT 1994 (G.3); General Exceptions: Article XIV of the GATS (G.4)	476
	Experts Advising a Panel. <i>See</i> Seek Information and Technical Advice (S.4). <i>See also</i> Standard of review, Article 11 of the DSU – Panel review of a risk assessment under Article 5.1 of the SPS Agreement (S.7.8)	476
	<b>F</b>	<b>477</b>
	Fact Finding. <i>See</i> Burden of Proof (B.3); Business Confidential Information (B.4); Consultations (C.7); Inferences Drawn from the Refusal of a Party to Provide Information (I.1); Seek Information and Technical Advice (S.4); Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU (S.7.2–9); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6)	477
	Factual vs. Legal Findings. <i>See</i> Scope of Appellate Review, Issues of law vs. Issues of fact (Article 17.6 of the DSU) (S.3.3)	477
	Financial contribution. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement, Article 1.1(a)(1) (S.2.3)	477
	Financial contribution – “in kind”. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement, Article 1.1(a)(1)(iii) (S.2.6–7)	477
	<b>G</b>	<b>478</b>
	<b>G.1 GATS</b>	<b>478</b>
G.1.1	Article I: Scope of application – Measures affecting trade in services. <i>See also</i> GATT 1994, Relationship between the GATT 1994 and the GATS (G.2.2)	478
	Article II. <i>See</i> MFN Treatment, Article II of the GATS (M.2.2)	481
G.1.2	Schedules	481
G.1.2.1	Interpretation of schedules. <i>See also</i> Interpretation and clarification of Members’ schedules of tariff concessions (T.1.2)	481
G.1.2.2	Relevance of the Central Product Classification (CPC), Services Sectoral Classification List (W/120) and Scheduling Guidelines	486
	Article XIV. <i>See</i> General Exceptions: Article XIV of the GATS (G.4)	490
G.1.3	Article XVI – Market access	490
G.1.3.1	General	490
G.1.3.2	Article XVI:1 – Relation to paragraph 2	491
G.1.3.3	Article XVI:2 – Chapeau	491
G.1.3.4	Article XVI:2(a) – “limitations on the number of service suppliers”	492
G.1.3.5	Article XVI:2(c) – “limitations on the total number of service operations”	494
G.1.3.6	Article XVI:2 – Measures directed at consumers	495
	Article XVII. <i>See</i> National Treatment, Article XVII of the GATS (N.1.13)	496

<b>G.2</b>	<b>GATT 1994</b>	<b>496</b>
	Article I. <i>See</i> Enabling Clause, Paragraph 1 (E.1.1); MFN Treatment, Article I of the GATT 1994 (M.2.1)	496
	Article II. <i>See</i> Tariff Concessions (T.1)	496
	Article III. <i>See</i> National Treatment (N.1); SCM Agreement, Article III:8 of the GATT 1994 – Subsidies (S.2.42)	496
	Article VI. <i>See</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement (A.3)	496
	Article VI:3. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement, Article VI:3 of the GATT 1994 – Subsidies (S.2.43)	496
	Article VIII. <i>See</i> International Monetary Fund – “Coherence” (I.2)	496
	Article X. <i>See</i> Licensing Agreement (L.2); Publication and Administration of Trade Regulations (P.5)	496
	Article XI. <i>See</i> Quantitative Restrictions (Q.1)	496
	Article XIII. <i>See</i> Tariff Quotas – Non-Discriminatory Administration (T.2)	496
	Article XV. <i>See</i> International Monetary Fund – “Coherence” (I.2); Seek Information and Technical Advice (S.4)	496
	Article XVI. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement, Relationship between the SCM Agreement and the GATT 1994 (S.2.41)	496
	Article XVIII:11, <i>Ad Note</i> . <i>See</i> Balance-of- Payments Restrictions (B.1)	496
	Article XVIII:11, <i>Proviso</i> . <i>See</i> Balance-of- Payments Restrictions (B.1)	496
	Article XIX. <i>See</i> Safeguards Agreement, Article XIX of the GATT 1994 (S.1.45–50); Safeguards Agreement, Relationship between the Safeguards Agreement and the GATT 1994 (S.1.44)	496
	Article XX. <i>See</i> General Exceptions, Article XX of the GATT 1994 (G.3)	496
	Article XXIV. <i>See</i> Regional Trade Agreements (R.1)	496
G.2.1	Language of Annex 1A incorporating the GATT 1994 into the WTO Agreement. <i>See also</i> Status of Panel and Appellate Body Reports (S.8); WTO Agreement (W.4)	497
	Relationship between the GATT 1994 and the Agreement on Agriculture. <i>See</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Relationship between the Agreement on Agriculture and the GATT 1994 (A.1.37)	498
	Relationship between the GATT 1994 and the Anti-Dumping Agreement. <i>See</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Relationship between the Anti-Dumping Agreement and the GATT 1994 (A.3.64)	498
G.2.2	Relationship between the GATT 1994 and the GATS. <i>See also</i> GATS, Article I: Scope of application – Measures affecting trade in services (G.1.1)	498
	Relationship between the GATT 1994 and the Agreement on Import Licensing Procedures. <i>See</i> Licensing Agreement (L.2)	499
	Relationship between the GATT 1994 and the Agreement on Safeguards. <i>See</i> Safeguards Agreement, Relationship between the Safeguards Agreement and the GATT 1994 (S.1.44)	499

Relationship between the GATT 1994 and the SCM Agreement. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement, Relationship between the SCM Agreement and the GATT 1994 (S.2.41)	500
Relationship between the GATT 1994 and the schedules to the GATT 1994. <i>See</i> Tariff Concessions (T.1)	500
Relationship between the GATT 1994 and the TRIMs Agreement. <i>See</i> TRIMs Agreement (T.8A)	500
<b>G.3 General Exceptions: Article XX of the GATT 1994. <i>See also</i> General Exceptions: Article XIV of the GATS (G.4)</b>	<b>500</b>
G.3.1 Article XX – Two-tier analysis	500
G.3.2 Article XX – Relationship with substantive obligations under the GATT 1994	500
G.3.3 Article XX(b) – Evidence. <i>See also</i> General Exceptions: Article XX of the GATT 1994, Article XX(d) – Necessity test (G.3.6)	502
G.3.3A Article XX(a) and (b) – Necessity test. <i>See also</i> General Exceptions: Article XX of the GATT 1994, Article XX(d) – Necessity test (G.3.6); General Exceptions: Article XIV of the GATS, Article XIV(a) – Necessity test – Reasonably available alternative (G.4.4); TBT Agreement, Article 2.2 – Not more trade-restrictive than necessary to fulfill a legitimate objective (T.4.2B)	502
G.3.4 Article XX(b) – Objective pursued	513
G.3.4A Article XX(b) – Alternative measures	513
G.3.5 Article XX(d) – General	516
G.3.5A Article XX(d) – “laws or regulations”	517
G.3.5B Article XX(d) – “to secure compliance”	518
G.3.6 Article XX(d) – Necessity test. <i>See also</i> General Exceptions: Article XX of the GATT 1994, Article XX(b) – Evidence (G.3.3); General Exceptions: Article XX of the GATT 1994, Article XX(a) and (b) – Necessity test (G.3.3A); General Exceptions: Article XIV of the GATS, Article XIV(a) – Necessity test – Reasonably available alternative (G.4.4); TBT Agreement, Article 2.2 – Not more trade-restrictive than necessary to fulfill a legitimate objective (T.4.2B)	519
G.3.7 Article XX(g) – “conservation of exhaustible natural resources”	524
G.3.8 Article XX(g) – “measures made effective in conjunction with”	525
G.3.9 Article XX(g) – “relating to”	527
G.3.10 Article XX(g) – Jurisdictional limitation. <i>See also</i> National Treatment, Relationship between Article III and Article XX (N.1.12)	528
G.3.10A Article XX(j) – Products in short supply	529
G.3.11 Chapeau of Article XX – General	529
G.3.12 Chapeau of Article XX – “arbitrary or unjustifiable discrimination between countries where the same conditions prevail”	532
G.3.13 Chapeau of Article XX – “disguised restriction on international trade”	538
<b>G.4 General Exceptions: Article XIV of the GATS. <i>See also</i> General Exceptions: Article XX of the GATT 1994 (G.3)</b>	<b>539</b>
G.4.1 Relationship to Article XX of the GATT 1994	539

G.4.2	Article XIV(a) – “public morals” and “public order”	540
G.4.3	Article XIV(a) – Burden of proof	540
G.4.4	Article XIV(a) – Necessity test – Reasonably available alternative. <i>See also</i> General Exceptions: Article XX of the GATT 1994, Article XX(a) and (b) – Necessity test (G.3.3A); General Exceptions: Article XX of the GATT 1994, Article XX(d) – Necessity test (G.3.6); TBT Agreement, Article 2.2 – Not more trade-restrictive than necessary to fulfill a legitimate objective (T.4.2B)	541
G.4.5	Chapeau of Article XIV	544
	<b>H</b>	<b>547</b>
<b>H.1</b>	<b>Harmonized System</b>	547
	Hearings. <i>See</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 27 – Oral hearing (W.2.11)	552
	<b>I</b>	<b>553</b>
	Implementation of DSB Rulings. <i>See</i> Review of Implementation of DSB Rulings, Article 21.5 of the DSU (R.4)	553
<b>I.0</b>	<b>Implementation Recommendations – Article 19.1 of the DSU. <i>See also</i> SCM Agreement, Article 4.7 – “withdraw the subsidy without delay” (S.2.19); SCM Agreement, Article 7.8 – Remedies (S.2.19C)</b>	<b>553</b>
	Import Licensing. <i>See</i> Licensing Agreement (L.2)	561
	Indirect Subsidization – Pass-Through. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement, Article VI:3 of the GATT 1994 – Subsidies (S.2.43)	561
<b>I.1</b>	<b>Inferences Drawn from the Refusal of a Party to Provide Information. <i>See also</i> Business Confidential Information (B.4); Confidentiality (C.6); Evidence (E.3); SCM Agreement, Annex V – Procedures for Developing Information Concerning Serious Prejudice (S.2.40A); Seek Information and Technical Advice (S.4)</b>	<b>561</b>
	Internal Taxation Regulation. <i>See</i> National Treatment, Article III:2 of the GATT 1994, first and second sentences (N.1.2–8); Taxation (T.3)	563
	Intellectual Property. <i>See</i> TRIPS Agreement (T.9)	563
<b>I.2</b>	<b>International Monetary Fund – “Coherence”</b>	<b>563</b>
<b>I.3</b>	<b>Interpretation. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 17.6(ii) – “permissible interpretations” (A.3.60); Competence of Panels and the Appellate Body, Articles 3.2 and 19.2 of the DSU – “not add to or diminish rights and obligations” (C.3.2)</b>	<b>565</b>
I.3.1	General rules of treaty interpretation – Articles 31 and 32 of the Vienna Convention	565
I.3.2	Text. <i>See also</i> Interpretation, Legitimate expectations (I.3.5); Municipal Law (M.5)	566

I.3.3	Context	571
I.3.4	Domestic law and legislative history	575
I.3.5	Legitimate expectations. <i>See also</i> Non-Violation Claims (N.2)	576
I.3.6	Object and purpose	577
I.3.7	Principle of effectiveness	578
I.3.8	Principle of <i>in dubio mitius</i>	582
I.3.9	Subsequent practice	583
I.3.9A	Subsequent agreement. <i>See also</i> WTO Agreement, Article IX – Decision-making (W.4.1A)	588
I.3.9B	Relevant rules of international law	591
I.3.10	Supplementary means of interpretation – Article 32 of the Vienna Convention	594
I.3.11	Multiple authentic languages – Article 33 of the Vienna Convention	607
I.3.12	Historical materials	609
I.3.13	Principle of <i>ejusdem generis</i>	613
	Issues of Fact/Law. <i>See</i> Scope of Appellate Review, Issues of law vs. Issues of fact (Article 17.6 of the DSU) (S.3.3)	614
	<b>J</b>	<b>615</b>
J.1	<b>Judicial Economy. <i>See also</i> Completion of the Legal Analysis by the Appellate Body (C.4); Scope of Appellate Review (S.3); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6)</b>	<b>615</b>
J.2	<b>Jurisdiction. <i>See also</i> Competence of Panels and the Appellate Body (C.3); Scope of Appellate Review (S.3); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6)</b>	<b>626</b>
J.2.1	General. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 17.4 – “matter referred to the DSB” (A.3.56); Balance-of-Payments Restrictions (B.1); Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1); Mandatory and Discretionary Legislation (M.1)	626
	<b>L</b>	<b>634</b>
	Languages. <i>See</i> Interpretation, Multiple authentic languages – Article 33 of the Vienna Convention (I.3.11)	634
	Law vs. Fact. <i>See</i> Scope of Appellate Review, Issues of law vs. Issues of fact (Article 17.6 of the DSU) (S.3.3)	634
L.0	<b>Least-Developed Countries</b>	<b>634</b>
L.1	<b>Legislation as such vs. Specific Application. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 17.3 – Consultations (A.3.55); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 17.4 – “matter referred to the DSB” (A.3.56); Burden of Proof, General (B.3.1); Jurisdiction, General (J.2.1); Mandatory and Discretionary Legislation (M.1); Municipal Law (M.5); Non-Violation Claims, Article XXIII:1(b) of the GATT 1994 – “any measure” (N.2.2); Terms of Reference of Panels, Specific measures at issue (T.6.3)</b>	<b>634</b>
	Legitimate expectations. <i>See</i> Interpretation, Legitimate expectations (I.3.5)	645

<b>L.2</b>	<b>Licensing Agreement</b>	<b>645</b>
	Like products. <i>See</i> National Treatment, Article III:2 of the GATT 1994, first sentence – “like products” (N.1.3); National Treatment, Article III:4 of the GATT 1994 – Regulatory discrimination, “Like products” (N.1.9.1); Textiles and Clothing Agreement, Article 6.2 – “like products” (T.7.5)	646
<b>L.3</b>	<b>Lomé Convention</b>	<b>647</b>
	<b>M</b>	<b>648</b>
<b>M.1</b>	<b>Mandatory and Discretionary Legislation. <i>See also</i> Burden of proof, General (B.3.1); Jurisdiction, General (J.2.1); Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1); Municipal Law (M.5); Request for the Establishment of a Panel, Article 6.2 of the DSU – Specific measures at issue (R.2.3); Terms of Reference of Panels, Specific measures at issue (T.6.3)</b>	<b>648</b>
	Marrakesh Agreement Establishing the World Trade Organization. <i>See</i> WTO Agreement (W.4)	653
	Matter referred to the DSB. <i>See</i> Claims and Arguments (C.1); Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1); Request for the Establishment of a Panel (R.2); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6)	653
	Measure at Issue. <i>See</i> Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1); Non-Violation Claims, Article XXIII:1(b) of the GATT 1994 – “any measure” (N.2.2); Request for Establishment of a Panel, Article 6.2 of the DSU – Specific measures at issue (R.2.3); Terms of Reference of Panels, Specific measures at issue (T.6.3)	653
	Measures affecting Trade in Services. <i>See</i> GATS, Article I: Scope of application – Measures affecting trade in services (G.1.1)	653
	Measures of the Kind. <i>See</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Article 4.2 and Footnote 1 (A.1.9–13)	653
<b>M.2</b>	<b>MFN Treatment. <i>See also</i> Enabling Clause (E.1); National Treatment, Article III:4 of the GATT 1994 – “less favourable treatment” (N.1.11); Tariff Quotas – Non-Discriminatory Administration (T.2); TBT Agreement, Article 2.1 – MFN and national treatment obligations, “treatment no less favourable” (T.4.2A.5)</b>	<b>654</b>
M.2.1	Article I of the GATT 1994	654
M.2.2	Article II of the GATS. <i>See also</i> National Treatment, Article XVII of the GATS (N.1.13)	656
M.2.3	Article 4 of the TRIPS Agreement	657
	Minimum Import Price. <i>See</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Article 4.2 and Footnote 1 (A.1.9–13)	658
	Modalities Paper. <i>See</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Relationship between the Agreement on Agriculture and the Modalities Paper (A.1.37A)	658

<b>M.3</b>	<b>Mootness of Panel Findings as a Consequence of Appellate Body Rulings. <i>See also</i> Completion of the Legal Analysis by the Appellate Body (C.4); Scope of Appellate Review (S.3)</b>	<b>658</b>
	Multiple Authentic Languages. <i>See</i> Interpretation, Multiple authentic languages – Article 33 of the Vienna Convention (I.3.11)	664
<b>M.4</b>	<b>Multiple Complainants. <i>See also</i> Panel Reports, Separate panel reports (P.1.3); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 16 – Process, Rule 16(1) – Adoption of additional procedures (W.2.6.1)</b>	<b>664</b>
<b>M.5</b>	<b>Municipal Law. <i>See also</i> Interpretation, Text (I.3.2); Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1); Mandatory and Discretionary Legislation (M.1)</b>	<b>666</b>
<b>M.6</b>	<b>Mutually Agreed Solutions. <i>See also</i> Right to Bring Claims – Legal Interest (R.5)</b>	<b>676</b>
	<b>N</b>	<b>678</b>
<b>N.1</b>	<b>National Treatment</b>	<b>678</b>
N.1.1	Article III:1 of the GATT 1994 – General principle	678
N.1.1A	Relationship between Article II and Article III:2 of the GATT 1994	679
N.1.2	Article III:2 of the GATT 1994 – Tax discrimination. <i>See also</i> Taxation (T.3)	683
N.1.3	Article III:2 of the GATT 1994, first sentence – “like products”. <i>See also</i> National Treatment, Article III:4 of the GATT 1994 – Regulatory discrimination (N.1.9); Textiles and Clothing Agreement, Article 6.2 – “like products” (T.7.5); TBT Agreement, Article 2.1 – MFN and national treatment obligations, “like products” (T.4.2A.4)	683
N.1.3.1	Scope of “like products”	684
N.1.3.2	Criteria	685
N.1.4	Article III:2 of the GATT 1994, first sentence – “in excess of”	688
N.1.5	Article III:2 of the GATT 1994 – Notions of “like” and “directly competitive or substitutable” products	690
N.1.6	Article III:2 of the GATT 1994, second sentence – “directly competitive or substitutable” products. <i>See also</i> Directly Competitive or Substitutable Products (D.1); Textiles and Clothing Agreement, Article 6.2 – “directly competitive products” (T.7.4)	691
N.1.7	Article III:2 of the GATT 1994, second sentence – “not similarly taxed”	695
N.1.8	Article III:2 of the GATT 1994, second sentence – “so as to afford protection”	697
N.1.9	Article III:4 of the GATT 1994 – Regulatory discrimination. <i>See also</i> National Treatment, Article III:2 of the GATT 1994, first sentence – “like products” (N.1.3); Textiles and Clothing Agreement, Article 6.2 – “like products” (T.7.5); TBT Agreement, Article 2.1 – MFN and national treatment obligations, “like products” (T.4.2A.4)	698

N.1.9.1	“Like products”	698
N.1.9.2	Relation to general principle in Article III:1	699
N.1.9.3	Relation to Article III:2	700
N.1.9.4	Likeness criteria	701
N.1.9.5	Evidence	704
N.1.10	Article III:4 of the GATT 1994 – “affecting”	705
N.1.11	Article III:4 of the GATT 1994 – “less favourable treatment”. <i>See also</i> MFN Treatment (M.2); National Treatment, Article XVII of the GATS (N.1.13); National Treatment, Article 3.1 of the TRIPS Agreement (N.1.14); TBT Agreement, Article 2.1 – MFN and national treatment obligations, “treatment no less favourable” (T.4.2A.5)	706
N.1.11A	Article III:8 of the GATT 1994 – Derogations from the National Treatment Obligation. <i>See also</i> SCM Agreement, Relationship between the SCM Agreement and the GATT 1994 (S.2.41); SCM Agreement, Relationship between the SCM Agreement and the TRIMs Agreement (S.2.45); TRIMs Agreement (T.8A)	712
N.1.11A.1	Article III:8(a) – Government procurement	712
N.1.11A.2	Article III:8(b) – Subsidies to domestic producers. <i>See also</i> SCM Agreement, Article III:8 of the GATT 1994 – Subsidies (S.2.42)	720
N.1.12	Relationship between Article III and Article XX. <i>See also</i> General Exceptions: Article XX of the GATT 1994, Article XX(g) – Jurisdictional limitation (G.3.10)	722
N.1.13	Article XVII of the GATS. <i>See also</i> MFN Treatment, Article II of the GATS (M.2.2); National Treatment, Article III:4 of the GATT 1994 – “less favourable treatment” (N.1.11)	723
N.1.14	Article 3.1 of the TRIPS Agreement. <i>See also</i> National Treatment, Article III:4 of the GATT 1994 – “less favourable treatment” (N.1.11) Non-Discrimination. <i>See</i> Enabling Clause (E.1); MFN Treatment (M.2); National Treatment (N.1); State Trading Enterprises: Article XVII of the GATT 1994 (S.7A); Tariff Quotas – Non-Discriminatory Administration (T.2); TBT Agreement, Article 2.1 – MFN and national treatment obligations (T.4.2A) Non-Governmental Organizations. <i>See Amicus Curiae</i> Briefs, Briefs submitted by NGOs, associations, and individuals (A.2.1)	725
<b>N.2</b>	<b>Non-Violation Claims. <i>See also</i> Interpretation, Legitimate expectations (I.3.5); Nullification or Impairment (N.3)</b>	<b>725</b>
N.2.1	Article XXIII:1(b) of the GATT 1994 – General	725
N.2.2	Article XXIII:1(b) of the GATT 1994 – “any measure”. <i>See also</i> Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1) Notice of Appeal. <i>See</i> Claims and Arguments (C.1); Request for the Establishment of a Panel (R.2); Scope of Appellate Review (S.3); Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU (S.7.2–9);	726



Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 20 – Notice of Appeal (W.2.7)	727
<b>N.3 Nullification or Impairment. <i>See also</i> Non-Violation Claims (N.2)</b>	<b>727</b>
<b>O</b>	<b>730</b>
<b>O.1 Objections. <i>See also</i> Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6)</b>	<b>730</b>
Objective Assessment of the Matter. <i>See</i> Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1); Request for the Establishment of a Panel (R.2); Scope of Appellate Review, Review of “objective assessment” by the panel – Article 11 of the DSU (S.3.2); Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU (S.7.2–9); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 20 – Notice of Appeal, Article 11 of the DSU – Allegation of the panel’s failure to objectively assess (W.2.7.5)	734
Omission to Act. <i>See</i> Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1)	734
Oral hearings. <i>See</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 27 – Oral hearing (W.2.11)	734
<b>O.2 Order of Analysis – Use of Assumptions</b>	<b>734</b>
Ordinary Meaning. <i>See</i> Interpretation (I.3)	743
<b>P</b>	<b>744</b>
<b>P.1 Panel Reports</b>	<b>744</b>
P.1.1 Basic rationale behind findings and conclusions. <i>See also</i> Claims and Arguments (C.1); Claims and Panel Reasoning (C.2); Standard of Review (S.7)	744
Duty to address issues. <i>See</i> Completion of the Legal Analysis by the Appellate Body (C.4); Judicial Economy (J.1); Jurisdiction (J.2); Objections (O.1)	748
P.1.2 Panel findings not appealed. <i>See also</i> Review of Implementation of DSB Rulings, Article 21.5 of the DSU – Effect of DSB rulings in the original dispute (R.4.3)	748
P.1.3 Separate panel reports. <i>See also</i> Multiple Complainants (M.4); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 16 – Process, Rule 16(1) – Adoption of additional procedures (W.2.6.1)	749
Status of the GATT panel reports. <i>See</i> Review of Implementation of DSB Rulings, Article 21.5 of the DSU – Effect of DSB rulings in the original dispute (R.4.3); Status of Panel and Appellate Body Reports (S.8)	750
Panel Request. <i>See</i> Claims and Arguments (C.1); Jurisdiction (J.2); Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1); Request for the Establishment of a Panel (R.2); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6)	750
Panels. <i>See</i> Claims and Arguments (C.1); Claims and Panel Reasoning (C.2); Inferences Drawn from the Refusal of a Party to Provide Information	

	(I.1); Judicial Economy (J.1); Jurisdiction (J.2); Panel Reports (P.1); Request for the Establishment of a Panel (R.2); Review of Implementation of DSB Rulings, Article 21.5 of the DSU (R.4); Seek Information and Technical Advice (S.4); Standard of Review (S.7); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6); Working Procedures for Panels (W.3)	750
<b>P.2</b>	<b>Paris Convention (1967). See also TRIPS Agreement, Article 2.1 – Intellectual property law conventions (T.9.2); TRIPS Agreement, Article 15.2 – Trademarks – Denial of protection on other grounds (T.9.4)</b>	<b>750</b>
P.2.1	Article 6(1) – Trademarks	750
P.2.2	Article 6 <i>quinquies</i> – Trademarks	751
P.2.3	Article 8 – Trade names	752
	Pass-Through of Indirect Subsidization. See SCM Agreement, Article VI:3 of the GATT 1994 – Subsidies (S.2.43)	752
	Patents. See TRIPS Agreement, Article 33 (T.9.7–9)	752
<b>P.3</b>	<b>Principles and Concepts of General Public International Law</b>	<b>752</b>
P.3.1	Good faith – <i>Pacta sunt servanda</i>	752
P.3.2	<i>Jura novit curia</i>	758
P.3.3	Non-recognition of foreign expropriations	758
P.3.4	No retroactive application of treaties. See also Temporal Application of Rights and Obligations (T.5)	758
P.3.5	Precautionary principle. See also SPS Agreement, Article 5.7 – Precautionary principle (S.6.23)	761
P.3.6	Proportionality. See also Safeguards Agreement, Article 5.1 – Application of the safeguard measure to the extent necessary to prevent or remedy serious injury and to facilitate adjustment (S.1.34); Textiles and Clothing Agreement, Article 6.4 – Attribution of serious damage (T.7.6)	762
P.3.7	Estoppel	763
P.3.8	Relevance/Effect of recourse to other dispute settlement mechanisms	764
<b>P.4</b>	<b>Private Counsel Participation in Dispute Settlement Proceedings</b>	<b>765</b>
<b>P.4A</b>	<b>Prompt Settlement of Disputes – Article 3.3 of the DSU. See also Completion of the Legal Analysis by the Appellate Body (C.4); Recourse to the DSU for Violations of the Covered Agreements (R.0); Review of Implementation of DSB Rulings, Article 21.5 of the DSU (R.4); Scope of Appellate Review (S.3); Status of Panel and Appellate Body Reports (S.8); Working Procedures for Panels (W.3)</b>	<b>766</b>
<b>P.5</b>	<b>Publication and Administration of Trade Regulations. See also Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 12 – Public notice and explanation of determinations (A.3.53A); Safeguards Agreement, Article 3.1 (S.1.18–22); Safeguards Agreement, Article XIX of the GATT 1994 –</b>	

	<b>General (S.1.45); SCM Agreement, Article 22 – Public notice and explanation of determinations (S.2.34); TBT Agreement, Article 2.12 – Reasonable interval between publication and entry into force of technical regulations (T.4.6)</b>	<b>775</b>
P.5.1	Article X:1 of the GATT 1994 – Publication of laws, regulations, judicial decisions and administrative rulings of general application	775
P.5.2	Article X:2 of the GATT 1994 – Publication of measures of general application	776
P.5.3	Article X:3 of the GATT 1994	776
P.5.3.1	Paragraph (a) – Uniform, impartial and reasonable administration	776
P.5.3.2	Paragraph (b) – Independent judicial, arbitral or administrative review	781
P.5.4	SPS Agreement, Annex B on “Transparency of SPS Regulations”, paragraph 1	786
	<b>Q</b>	<b>787</b>
	<b>Q.1 Quantitative Restrictions. <i>See also</i> Tariff Quotas – Non-Discriminatory Administration (T.2)</b>	<b>787</b>
Q.1.1	General elimination of quantitative restrictions – Article XI:1 of the GATT 1994	787
Q.1.2	Exclusions from the scope of Article XI:1 – Article XI:2 of the GATT 1994	787
	<b>R</b>	<b>792</b>
	Refusal of a Party to Provide Information. <i>See</i> Inferences Drawn from the Refusal of a Party to Provide Information (I.1)	792
	<b>R.0 Recourse to the DSU for Violations of the Covered Agreements. <i>See also</i> Prompt Settlement of Disputes – Article 3.3 of the DSU (P.4A); Suspension of Concessions or Other Obligations (S.9)</b>	<b>792</b>
	<b>R.1 Regional Trade Agreements</b>	<b>797</b>
R.1.1	Article XXIV:4 – Purpose of trade integration	797
R.1.2	Article XXIV:5 – Chapeau	798
R.1.3	Article XXIV:5(a) – Duties and other external trade regulations “not on the whole” higher or more trade restrictive than prior to customs union formation	798
R.1.4	Article XXIV:8(a)(i) – Elimination of duties and other trade restrictions on “substantially all” internal trade	799
R.1.5	Article XXIV:8(a)(ii) – “substantially the same” duties and other regulations on external trade	801
R.1.6	Relationship between Article XXIV of the GATT 1994 and the Safeguards Agreement. <i>See also</i> Safeguards Agreement, Article 2 – Parallelism (S.1.13); Safeguards Agreement, Article 2.1, Footnote 1 – Customs union (S.1.16); Safeguards Agreement, Article 2.2 – Free trade area (S.1.17)	802
R.1.7	Relationship between regional trade agreements and the covered agreements	803

<b>R.2</b>	<b>Request for the Establishment of a Panel. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 17.5 – Facts made available to the investigating authority (A.3.57); Due process, Due process in WTO dispute settlement proceedings (D.2.2); Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU (S.7.2–9); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6); Working Procedures for Appellate Review (W.2)</b>	<b>803</b>
R.2.1	Article 6.2 of the DSU – General	803
R.2.2	Article 6.2 of the DSU – Claims and legal basis of the complaint. <i>See also</i> Burden of Proof, General (B.3.1); Claims and Arguments (C.1); Claims and Panel Reasoning (C.2); Enabling Clause, Paragraph 1 (E.1.1)	810
R.2.3	Article 6.2 of the DSU – Specific measures at issue. <i>See also</i> Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1); Mandatory and Discretionary Legislation (M.1); Terms of Reference of Panels, Specific measures at issue (T.6.3)	820
R.2.4	Article 6.2 of the DSU – “whether consultations were held”	833
R.2.5	Relationship between Article 6.2 and Article 21.5 of the DSU Resolution of a Dispute. <i>See</i> Mutually Agreed Solutions (M.6); Review of Implementation of DSB Rulings, Article 21.5 of the DSU (R.4); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 30 – Withdrawal (W.2.13)	834
<b>R.3</b>	<b>Retroactive Application of Trade Measures</b>	<b>836</b>
	Review of Countervailing Duty Measures. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement, Article 21 (S.2.29–33)	837
<b>R.4</b>	<b>Review of Implementation of DSB Rulings, Article 21.5 of the DSU. <i>See also</i> Prompt Settlement of Disputes – Article 3.3 of the DSU (P.4A)</b>	<b>837</b>
R.4.0	Article 21.5 of the DSU – General	837
R.4.1	Article 21.5 of the DSU – “measures taken to comply”	844
R.4.2	Article 21.5 of the DSU – New claims	862
R.4.3	Article 21.5 of the DSU – Effect of DSB rulings in the original dispute. <i>See also</i> Panel Reports, Panel findings not appealed (P.1.2); Status of Panel and Appellate Body Reports (S.8)	866
R.4.4	Article 21.5 of the DSU – “these dispute settlement procedures”	877
R.4.5	Article 21.5 of the DSU – Prejudice	878
R.4.6	Article 21.5 of the DSU – Post suspension of concessions. <i>See also</i> Suspension of Concessions or Other Obligations (S.9)	879
<b>R.5</b>	<b>Right to Bring Claims – Legal Interest. <i>See also</i> Mutually Agreed Solutions (M.6)</b>	<b>884</b>
<b>R.6</b>	<b>Rules of Conduct. <i>See also</i> Due process, Due process in WTO dispute settlement proceedings (D.2.2)</b>	<b>888</b>

## VOLUME 2

<b>S</b>	<b>892</b>
<b>S.1 Safeguards Agreement. <i>See also</i> Accession Protocols, Transitional safeguard mechanism (A.0.3); Agreement on Agriculture, Article 5 – Special safeguard (A.1.14); Textiles and Clothing Agreement, Article 6 – Transitional safeguard (T.7.1)</b>	<b>892</b>
S.1.1 General. <i>See also</i> Safeguards Agreement, Article XIX of the GATT 1994 – General (S.1.45)	892
S.1.2 Standard of Review. <i>See also</i> Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU (S.7.2–9)	893
S.1.3 Article 2.1 – “like or directly competitive products”. <i>See also</i> Safeguards Agreement, Article 4.1(c) – Domestic industry (S.1.25)	894
S.1.4 Article 2.1 – Domestic decision-making	895
S.1.5 Articles 2.1 and 4.1(c) – Territorial application of safeguard measure	895
S.1.6 Article 2.1 – Increased imports	896
S.1.7 Article 2.1 – Examination of trends	897
S.1.8 Article 2.1 – Decrease at the end of an investigation period	898
S.1.9 Article 2.1 – Increase relative to domestic production	899
S.1.10 Article 2.1 – Serious injury or threat thereof. <i>See also</i> Safeguards Agreement, Article 4.1(b) – Threat of serious injury (S.1.24)	899
S.1.11 Article 2.1 – Causation. <i>See also</i> Safeguards Agreement, Article 4.2(b) – Causation (S.1.29–32)	901
S.1.12 Article 2.1 – “under such conditions”	901
S.1.13 Article 2 – Parallelism. <i>See also</i> Regional Trade Agreements, Relationship between Article XXIV of the GATT 1994 and the Safeguards Agreement (R.1.6)	901
S.1.13.1 General	901
S.1.13.2 <i>Prima facie</i> case	903
S.1.14 Article 2 – “factors other than increased imports”	903
S.1.15 Article 2 – Separate determinations	904
S.1.16 Article 2.1, Footnote 1 – Customs union. <i>See also</i> Regional Trade Agreements, Relationship between Article XXIV of the GATT 1994 and the Safeguards Agreement (R.1.6)	905
S.1.17 Article 2.2 – Free trade area. <i>See also</i> Regional Trade Agreements, Relationship between Article XXIV of the GATT 1994 and the Safeguards Agreement (R.1.6)	906
S.1.18 Article 3.1 – General	907
S.1.19 Article 3.1 – Investigation	907
S.1.20 Article 3.1 – Multiple findings	909
S.1.21 Article 3.1 – Published report	910
S.1.22 Article 3.1 – Reasoned conclusions	911
S.1.23 Article 4.1(a) – Serious injury	912
S.1.24 Article 4.1(b) – Threat of serious injury. <i>See also</i> Safeguards Agreement, Article 2.1 – Serious injury or threat thereof (S.1.10); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 3.7 – Threat of material injury (A.3.27); SCM Agreement, Article 15.7 – Threat of material injury (S.2.25B)	913

S.1.25	Article 4.1(c) – Domestic industry. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 4 – Definition of domestic industry (A.3.27A); Safeguards Agreement, Article 2.1 – “like or directly competitive products” (S.1.3); Textiles and Clothing Agreement, Article 6.2 – “domestic industry” (T.7.3) Article 4.2(a) – “increase in imports”. <i>See</i> Safeguards Agreement, Article 2.1 – Increased imports (S.1.6)	914 916
S.1.26	Article 4.2(a) – Evaluation of relevant injury factors. <i>See also</i> Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU – Objective assessment of whether the investigating authority’s explanation is reasoned and adequate (S.7.4)	916
S.1.27	Article 4.2(a) – Data for the injury evaluation	918
S.1.28	Article 4.2(a) – Injury data relating to the most recent past	919
S.1.29	Article 4.2(b) – Causation of injury by increased imports. <i>See also</i> SCM Agreement, Article 15.5 – Causation (S.2.25A); Safeguards Agreement, Article 3.5 – Causation (A.3.23A)	920
S.1.30	Article 4.2(b) – Causation of injury by increased imports vs. Other factors	920
S.1.31	Article 4.2(b) – Non-attribution of injury caused by other factors. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 3.5 – Non-attribution of injury caused by other known factors (A.3.24); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 3.5 – Individual vs. Collective effects of other factors (A.3.26)	922
S.1.32	Article 4.2(b) – Causation – Assumptions regarding increased imports and injury	924
S.1.33	Article 4.2(c) – Publication of a detailed analysis. <i>See also</i> Publication and Administration of Trade Regulations (P.5); Safeguards Agreement, Article 3.1 – General (S.1.18); Safeguards Agreement, Relationship between Article XIX of the GATT 1994 and Article 3.1 of the Safeguards Agreement (S.1.46); Safeguards Agreement, Relationship between Article XIX of the GATT 1994 and Article 4.2(c) of the Safeguards Agreement (S.1.47)	925
S.1.34	Article 5.1 – Application of the safeguard measure to the extent necessary to prevent or remedy serious injury and to facilitate adjustment. <i>See also</i> Principles and Concepts of General Public International Law, Proportionality (P.3.6)	926
S.1.35	Article 5.1 – Justification of the necessary extent of the application	926
S.1.36	Relationship between Articles 5.1 and 4.2(b) of the Safeguards Agreement	928
S.1.37	Article 5.2(b) – Quota modulation	929
S.1.38	Article 8.1 – Equivalent level of concessions	930
S.1.39	Article 9.1 – Exclusion of developing country Members from the application of safeguards	931
S.1.40	Article 12.1 – Immediate notification	932
S.1.41	Article 12.2 – Notification of all pertinent information	933
S.1.42	Article 12.3 – “adequate opportunity for prior consultations”	934
S.1.43	Relationship between the Safeguards Agreement and the Anti-Dumping Agreement	936
S.1.44	Relationship between the Safeguards Agreement and the GATT 1994	936
S.1.45	Article XIX of the GATT 1994 – General. <i>See also</i> Accession Protocols, Transitional safeguard mechanism (A.0.3); Agreement on Agriculture,	

	Article 5 – Special safeguard (A.1.14); Publication and Administration of Trade Regulations (P.5); Safeguards Agreement, General (S.1.1); Textiles and Clothing Agreement, Article 6 – Transitional safeguard (T.7.1)	938
S.1.46	Relationship between Article XIX of the GATT 1994 and Article 3.1 of the Safeguards Agreement. <i>See also</i> Safeguards Agreement, Article 4.2(c) – Publication of a detailed analysis (S.1.33)	939
S.1.47	Relationship between Article XIX of the GATT 1994 and Article 4.2(c) of the Safeguards Agreement. <i>See also</i> Safeguards Agreement, Article 4.2(c) – Publication of a detailed analysis (S.1.33)	940
	Relationship between the Safeguards Agreement and Section 16 of China’s Accession Protocol. <i>See</i> Accession Protocols, Relationship with other WTO agreements (A.0.2)	940
S.1.48	Article XIX of the GATT 1994 – “as a result of”	940
S.1.49	Article XIX of the GATT 1994 – “such product”	941
S.1.50	Article XIX of the GATT 1994 – “unforeseen developments”	942
	Safeguard Measures – China-Specific Transitional Mechanism. <i>See</i> Accession Protocols, Transitional safeguard mechanism (A.0.3)	944
	Schedules of Concessions. <i>See</i> Tariff Concessions (T.1) and GATS, Schedules (G.1.2)	944
<b>S.2</b>	<b>SCM Agreement</b>	<b>944</b>
S.2.1	Object and purpose	944
S.2.2	Article 1.1 – “subsidy”. <i>See also</i> SCM Agreement, Article 15 – Determination of injury (S.2.24A)	948
S.2.3	Article 1.1(a)(1) – “financial contribution”	949
S.2.3A	Article 1.1(a)(1) – “public body”	954
S.2.3B	Article 1.1(a)(1)(i) – “direct transfer of funds”	962
S.2.4	Article 1.1(a)(1)(ii) – “government revenue . . . otherwise due”	965
S.2.5	Article 1.1(a)(1)(ii), Footnote 1 – Exemption from or remission of internal taxes upon exportation	968
S.2.6	Article 1.1(a)(1)(iii) – Goods or services provided by a government	968
S.2.7	Article 1.1(a)(1)(iii) – Purchases of goods by a government	972
S.2.8	Article 1.1(a)(1)(iv) – Payments to a funding mechanism, entrustment or direction to a private body	974
S.2.9	Article 1.1(b) – Conferral of a benefit on a recipient. <i>See also</i> SCM Agreement, Article 14 – Chapeau – Calculation of the benefit to the “recipient” (S.2.22)	980
S.2.9A	Article 1.1(b) – Market benchmark. <i>See also</i> SCM Agreement, Article 6.3 – Serious prejudice, Relevant market (S.2.19B.1)	985
S.2.9B	Article 1.1(b) – Extinction of the benefit	1003
S.2.10	Article 1.1 – Pass-through of indirect subsidies. <i>See also</i> SCM Agreement, Article 32.1 – Specific action against a subsidy (S.2.36); SCM Agreement, Article VI.3 of the GATT 1994 – Subsidies (S.2.43)	1007
S.2.10A	Articles 1.2 and 2 – Specificity	1008

S.2.10A.1	General	1008
S.2.10A.2	Article 2.1 – Subsidies specific to certain enterprises	1008
S.2.10A.3	Article 2.1(c) – <i>De facto</i> specificity	1020
S.2.10A.4	Article 2.2 – Regional specificity	1023
S.2.11	Article 3.1(a) – “except as provided in the Agreement on Agriculture” – Export subsidies. <i>See also</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Relationship between the Agreement on Agriculture and the SCM Agreement (A.1.38)	1024
S.2.12	Article 3.1(a) – “contingent, in law or in fact, . . . upon export performance”	1025
S.2.13	Article 3.1(a) – Contingency in law	1029
S.2.14	Article 3.1(a) and Footnote 4 – Contingency in fact	1031
S.2.14A	Article 3.1(b) – “except as provided in the Agreement on Agriculture” – Import substitution subsidies. <i>See also</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Relationship between the Agreement on Agriculture and the SCM Agreement (A.1.38)	1038
S.2.15	Article 3.1(b) – “contingent upon the use of domestic over imported products”	1040
S.2.16	Article 3.1(b) – Contingent in law and contingent in fact	1041
S.2.17	Article 4, paragraphs 1 to 4 – Consultations	1043
S.2.18	Article 4.2 – “statement of available evidence”	1043
S.2.19	Article 4.7 – “withdraw the subsidy without delay”. <i>See also</i> Implementation Recommendations (I.0)	1044
S.2.19A	Article 5 – “adverse effects”	1048
S.2.19B	Article 6.3 – Serious Prejudice. <i>See</i> Order of analysis – Use of assumptions (O.2); SCM Agreement, Article 5 – “Adverse effects” (S.2.19A); SCM Agreement, Article 15.5 – Causation (S.2.25A); Scope of Appellate Review, Review of “objective assessment” by the panel – Article 11 of the DSU (S.3.2); Scope of Appellate Review, Issues of law vs. Issues of fact (Article 17.6 of the DSU) (S.3.3); Scope of Appellate Review, Need to address each issue raised (Article 17.12 of the DSU) (S.3.4); Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU – Objective assessment of the facts (S.7.3)	1051
S.2.19B.0	General	1051
S.2.19B.1	Relevant market. <i>See also</i> SCM Agreement, Article 1.1(b) – Market benchmark (S.2.9A)	1054
S.2.19B.2	Displacement/impedance of imports/exports	1061
S.2.19B.3	Significant lost sales	1069
S.2.19B.4	Significant price suppression	1072
S.2.19B.5	Effect of the subsidy – Causation and non-attribution	1080
S.2.19B.6	Magnitude of subsidies	1092
S.2.19B.7	“Pass-through” analysis	1096
S.2.19B.8	Effect of subsidies over time. <i>See also</i> SCM Agreement, Actionable subsidies – Temporal scope (S.2.19D)	1098
S.2.19B.9	Threat of serious prejudice	1101
S.2.19B.10	Other effects of subsidies	1102
S.2.19B.11	Collective assessment of subsidies and their effects Article 6.6 and Article 6.8. <i>See</i> Annex V – Procedures for Developing Information Concerning Serious Prejudice (S.2.40A)	1103 1114



S.2.19C	Article 7.8 – Remedies. <i>See also</i> Implementation Recommendations – Article 19.1 of the DSU (I.0)	1114
S.2.19D	Actionable subsidies – Temporal scope. <i>See also</i> SCM Agreement, Article 6.3 – Serious Prejudice, Effect of subsidies over time (S.2.19B.8); Temporal Application of Rights and Obligations, SCM Agreement (T.5.1) Article 10 and Footnote 36 – Application of Article VI of the GATT 1994. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement, Article 1.1 – Pass-through of indirect subsidies (S.2.10); SCM Agreement, Article 32.1 – Specific action against a subsidy (S.2.36); SCM Agreement, Article VI:3 of the GATT 1994 – Subsidies (S.2.43)	1117
	Article 11 – Initiation and subsequent investigation. <i>See also</i> SCM Agreement, Article 21.4 – Relationship with Articles 11 and 12 (S.2.33)	1120
S.2.20	Article 11.4 – Initiation of an investigation	1120
S.2.21	Article 11.9 – Termination of an investigation. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 5.8 – Termination of the investigation (A.3.28A)	1121
S.2.21A	Article 11.11 – Time-limit for investigation Article 12 – Evidence. <i>See</i> Evidence, Panel’s review of evidence (E.3.2); SCM Agreement, Article 21.4 – Relationship with Articles 11 and 12 (S.2.33)	1122
S.2.21B	Article 12.1 – Notice of information required and opportunity to present evidence. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 6.1 (A.3.30)	1122
S.2.21C	Article 12.7 – Determinations on the basis of the facts available. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 6.8 and Annex II (A.3.33–36)	1123
S.2.21D	Article 12.8 and 12.9 – “Interested parties” and disclosure of essential facts	1123
S.2.22	Article 14 – Chapeau – Calculation of the benefit to the “recipient”. <i>See also</i> SCM Agreement, Article 1.1(b) – Conferral of a benefit on a recipient (S.2.9)	1127
S.2.22A	Article 14(a) – Government provision of equity capital	1132
S.2.22B	Article 14(b) – Government loans	1133
S.2.23	Article 14(d) – Provision of goods or services or purchases of goods – Calculation of adequacy of remuneration	1140
S.2.24	Article 14(d) – Alternative benchmark for calculating the adequacy of remuneration	1145
S.2.24A	Article 15 – Determination of injury. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 3.1 – General (A.3.15); SCM Agreement, Article 1.1 – “subsidy” (S.2.2)	1151
S.2.24B	Article 15.2 – Consideration of the volume of subsidized imports and their effects on prices. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 3.2 – Consideration of the volume of dumped imports and their effects on prices (A.3.20)	1153
S.2.25	Article 15.4 – Examination of the impact of subsidized imports on the domestic industry. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 3.4 (A.3.22–23)	1161
S.2.25A	Article 15.5 – Causation. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 3.5 (A.3.23A–26); Safeguards Agreement, Article 4.2(b) (S.1.29–32)	1162

S.2.25B	Article 15.7 – Threat of material injury. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 3.7 – Threat of material injury (A.3.27); and Safeguards Agreement, Article 4.1(b) – Threat of serious injury (S.1.24)	1166
S.2.26	Article 19.1 – Conditions for the imposition of countervailing duties	1169
S.2.27	Article 19.3 – Imposition of countervailing duties in the appropriate amounts and on a non-discriminatory basis. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 9.2 – Imposition of anti-dumping duties in the appropriate amounts and on a non-discriminatory basis, in respect of any product (A.3.40); SCM Agreement, Article VI:5 of the GATT 1994 – Anti-dumping and countervailing duties and “double remedies” (S.2.44)	1169
S.2.28	Article 19.4 – Calculation of countervailing duty rates on a per unit basis	1178
S.2.29	Article 21 – Duration and review of countervailing duties	1179
S.2.30	Article 21.1 – “only as long and to the extent necessary”	1180
S.2.31	Article 21.2 – Review of the need for continued imposition	1180
S.2.32	Article 21.3 – Termination of countervailing duties unless continued or recurrent subsidization and injury likely	1184
S.2.33	Article 21.4 – Relationship with Articles 11 and 12	1186
S.2.34	Article 22 – Public notice and explanation of determinations	1186
S.2.35	Article 27 – Special and differential treatment for developing country Members	1190
S.2.35.1	Paragraph 4 – Phase-out or standstill of export subsidies	1190
S.2.35.2	Paragraphs 10 and 11 – Higher <i>de minimis</i> subsidization threshold	1191
S.2.36	Article 32.1 – Specific action against a subsidy. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 18.1 – Specific action against dumping (A.3.61); SCM Agreement, Article 1.1 – Pass-through of indirect subsidies (S.2.10); SCM Agreement, Article VI:3 of the GATT 1994 – Subsidies (S.2.43)	1191
	Article 32.3 – Temporal Scope of Application. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement, Relationship between the SCM Agreement and the GATT 1994 (S.2.41); Temporal Application of Rights and Obligations, SCM Agreement (T.5.1)	1195
	Illustrative List of Export Subsidies: Items (c) and (d). <i>See</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Article 9.1(c) – Governmental action vs. Private action (A.1.25)	1195
S.2.37	Illustrative List of Export Subsidies: Item (e), Footnote 59, first sentence – “remission or deferral of direct taxes”	1195
S.2.38	Illustrative List of Export Subsidies: Item (e), Footnote 59, fifth sentence – “double taxation”	1195
S.2.39	Illustrative List of Export Subsidies: Item (j) – Export credit guarantee or insurance. <i>See also</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Article 9.1(c) – Governmental action vs. Private action (A.1.25); SCM Agreement, Illustrative List of Export Subsidies: Item (k) – Export credits (S.2.40)	1199
S.2.40	Illustrative List of Export Subsidies: Item (k) – Export credits. <i>See also</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Article 9.1(c) – Governmental action vs. Private action (A.1.25); SCM Agreement, Illustrative List of Export Subsidies: Item (j) – Export credit guarantee or insurance (S.2.39)	1205
S.2.40A	Annex V – Procedures for Developing Information Concerning Serious Prejudice. <i>See also</i> Inferences Drawn from the Refusal of a Party to Provide Information (I.1)	1206

	Relationship between the SCM Agreement and the Anti-Dumping Agreement. <i>See</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Relationship between the Anti-Dumping Agreement and the SCM Agreement (A.3.63)	1217
S.2.41	Relationship between the SCM Agreement and the GATT 1994. <i>See also</i> National Treatment, Article III:8 of the GATT 1994 – Derogations from the National Treatment Obligation (N.1.11A); TRIMs Agreement (T.8A)	1217
S.2.42	Article III:8 of the GATT 1994 – Subsidies. <i>See also</i> National Treatment, Article III:8 of the GATT 1994 – Derogations from the National Treatment Obligation, Article III:8(b) – Subsidies to domestic producers (N.1.11A.2); TRIMs Agreement – Article 2.1 and the relationship with the GATT 1994 (T.8A.2); TRIMs Agreement – Article 2.2, the Illustrative List, and the relationship with the GATT 1994 and the SCM Agreement (T.8A.3)	1220
S.2.43	Article VI:3 of the GATT 1994 – Subsidies. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 18.1 – Specific action against dumping (A.3.61); SCM Agreement, Article 1.1 – Pass-through of indirect subsidies (S.2.10); SCM Agreement, Article 32.1 – Specific action against a subsidy (S.2.36)	1220
S.2.44	Article VI:5 of the GATT 1994 – Anti-dumping and countervailing duties and “double remedies”. <i>See also</i> SCM Agreement, Article 19.3 – Imposition of countervailing duties in the appropriate amounts and on a non-discriminatory basis (S.2.27)	1221
S.2.45	Relationship between the SCM Agreement and the TRIMs Agreement. <i>See also</i> National Treatment, Article III:8 of the GATT 1994 – Derogations from the National Treatment Obligation (N.1.11A); TRIMs Agreement (T.8A)	1224
<b>S.3</b>	<b>Scope of Appellate Review. <i>See also</i> Competence of Panels and the Appellate Body (C.3); Completion of the Legal Analysis by the Appellate Body (C.4); Conditional Appeals (C.5); Judicial Economy (J.1); Jurisdiction (J.2); Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1); Mootness of Panel Findings as a Consequence of Appellate Body Rulings (M.3); Prompt Settlement of Disputes – Article 3.3 of the DSU (P.4A); Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU (S.7.2–9); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6); Working Procedures for Appellate Review (W.2)</b>	<b>1225</b>
S.3.1	General	1225
S.3.2	Review of “objective assessment” by the panel – Article 11 of the DSU. <i>See also</i> Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU (S.7.2–9)	1231
S.3.3	Issues of law vs. Issues of fact (Article 17.6 of the DSU)	1234
S.3.4	Need to address each issue raised (Article 17.12 of the DSU)	1247
<b>S.4</b>	<b>Seek Information and Technical Advice. <i>See also</i> Amicus Curiae Briefs (A.2); Burden of Proof (B.3); Business Confidential Information (B.4); Due process, Due process in WTO dispute settlement proceedings (D.2.2); Evidence (E.3); Inferences Drawn from the Refusal of a Party to Provide Information (I.1); Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU (S.7.2–9)</b>	<b>1250</b>

Separate Panel Reports. <i>See</i> Panel Reports, Separate panel reports (P.1.3)	1259
Services: Trade in Services. <i>See</i> GATS (G.1)	1259
Special and Differential Treatment. <i>See</i> Enabling Clause (E.1); SCM Agreement, Article 27 – Special and differential treatment for developing country Members (S.2.35)	1259
<b>S.5 Special or Additional Rules and Procedures for Dispute Settlement. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 17 – Consultation and Dispute Settlement (A.3.54)</b>	<b>1259</b>
<b>S.6 SPS Agreement</b>	<b>1261</b>
S.6.1 Difference between the appropriate level of protection and the SPS measure chosen to implement. <i>See also</i> SPS Agreement, Article 5 (S.6.9–23); SPS Agreement, Annex A – Definitions (S.6.23A)	1261
S.6.2 Article 2 – Basic rights and obligations. <i>See also</i> SPS Agreement, Article 5.1 (S.6.9–14)	1263
S.6.3 Article 2.2 and Article 5 – “sufficient scientific evidence”. <i>See also</i> Burden of Proof, Presumption – <i>Prima facie</i> case (B.3.2); SPS Agreement, Article 5.1 (S.6.9–14); SPS Agreement, Article 5.7 (S.6.19–23)	1263
S.6.4 Article 2.3 – “not arbitrarily or unjustifiably discriminate between Members where identical or similar conditions prevail”. <i>See also</i> SPS Agreement, Article 5.5 (S.6.15–17)	1266
S.6.5 Article 3 – Level of protection and harmonization of SPS measures	1266
S.6.6 Article 3.1 – “measures based on . . . international standards”	1267
S.6.7 Article 3.2 – “measures which conform to international standards”	1268
S.6.8 Article 3.3 – “measures which result in a higher level of . . . protection”	1270
S.6.9 Article 5.1 and Annex A, paragraph 4 – Concept of risk assessment	1273
S.6.10 Article 5.1 – Ascertainable risk	1276
S.6.11 Article 5.1 – Types of risk assessment	1278
S.6.12 Article 5.1 – Degree of risk	1278
S.6.13 Articles 5.1 and 5.2 – Risk assessment and scientific evidence	1281
S.6.13A Articles 5.1 and 5.2 – Risk assessment, scientific uncertainty and expert judgment	1288
S.6.14 Article 5.1 – Requirement to <i>base</i> measure on the risk assessment	1289
S.6.15 Article 5.5 – Consistency in the application of the appropriate level of protection	1290
S.6.16 Article 5.5 – Distinctions in the level of protection in different situations	1291
S.6.17 Article 5.5 – “result in discrimination or a disguised restriction”	1292
S.6.17A Article 5.6 – Relationship with other provisions of the SPS Agreement	1293
S.6.18 Article 5.6 – Not more trade restrictive than required to achieve the appropriate level of protection	1296
S.6.19 Article 5.7 – Provisional adoption of SPS measures	1300
S.6.20 Article 5.7 – “where relevant scientific evidence is insufficient”	1302
S.6.20A Article 5.7 – “on the basis of available pertinent information”	1309

S.6.21	Article 5.7 – “seek to obtain additional information”	1309
S.6.22	Article 5.7 – “review . . . within a reasonable period of time”	1310
S.6.23	Article 5.7 – Precautionary principle. <i>See also</i> Precautionary principle (P.3.5)	1311
S.6.23A	SPS Agreement, Annex A – Definitions. <i>See also</i> Difference between the appropriate level of protection and the SPS measure chosen to implement (S.6.1)	1312
S.6.24	Annex B on “Transparency of SPS Regulations”, paragraph 1 – “publication of laws, decrees or ordinances”	1315
S.6.24A	Annex C and Article 8	1315
<b>S.7</b>	<b>Standard of Review. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 17.6 – Standard of Review under the Anti-Dumping Agreement (A.3.58); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 17.6(ii) – “permissible interpretations” (A.3.60); Evidence (E.3); Panel Reports, Basic rationale behind findings and conclusions (P.1.1); Safeguards Agreement, General (S.1.1); Scope of Appellate Review (S.3); Seek Information and Technical Advice (S.4); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 20 – Notice of Appeal, Article 11 of the DSU – Allegation of the panel’s failure to objectively assess (W.2.7.5)</b>	<b>1318</b>
S.7.1	General	1318
S.7.2	Article 11 of the DSU – Objective assessment of the matter	1323
S.7.2A	Article 11 of the DSU – Objective assessment of the measure	1336
S.7.3	Article 11 of the DSU – Objective assessment of the facts. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 17.6(i) – “assessment of the facts” (A.3.59)	1341
S.7.4	Article 11 of the DSU – Objective assessment of whether the investigating authority’s explanation is reasoned and adequate	1371
S.7.5	Article 11 of the DSU – No <i>de novo</i> review	1382
S.7.6	Article 11 of the DSU – Temporal scope of review	1386
S.7.7	Article 11 of the DSU – “make such other findings [to] assist the DSB . . . in giving the rulings”	1388
S.7.8	Article 11 of the DSU – Panel review of a risk assessment under Article 5.1 of the SPS Agreement	1389
S.7.9	Article 11 of the DSU – Panel assessment of a claim under Article 5.6 of the SPS Agreement Standing. <i>See</i> Right to Bring Claims – Legal Interest (R.5)	1398 1400
<b>S.7A</b>	<b>State Trading Enterprises: Article XVII of the GATT 1994</b>	<b>1400</b>
S.7A.1	Article XVII of the GATT 1994 – “principles of non-discriminatory treatment”	1400
S.7A.2	Article XVII of the GATT 1994, <i>Ad Note</i> – Differential prices for commercial reasons	1402
S.7A.3	Article XVII:1 of the GATT 1994 – Relationship between subparagraphs (a) and (b)	1402
S.7A.4	Article XVII:1(b) of the GATT 1994 – “commercial considerations”	1405

S.7A.5	Article XVII:1(b) of the GATT 1994 – Afford adequate opportunity to compete for participation in purchases or sales	1406
S.7A.6	Article XVII:3 of the GATT 1994	1407
<b>S.8</b>	<b>Status of Panel and Appellate Body Reports. <i>See also</i> GATT 1994, Language of Annex 1A incorporating the GATT 1994 into the WTO Agreement (G.2.1); Panel Reports (P.1); Prompt Settlement of Disputes – Article 3.3 of the DSU (P.4A); Review of Implementation of DSB Rulings, Article 21.5 of the DSU – Effect of DSB rulings in the original dispute (R.4.3)</b>	<b>1408</b>
	Subsequent Practice. <i>See</i> Interpretation, Subsequent practice (I.3.9)	1411
	Subsidies. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement (S.2)	1411
	Supplementary Means of Interpretation. <i>See</i> Interpretation, Supplementary means of interpretation – Article 32 of the Vienna Convention (I.3.10)	1411
<b>S.9</b>	<b>Suspension of Concessions or Other Obligations. <i>See also</i> Recourse to the DSU for Violations of the Covered Agreements (R.0); Review of Implementation of DSB Rulings, Article 21.5 of the DSU – Post suspension of concessions (R.4.6); Terms of Reference of Panels, “Post suspension of concessions” (T.6.4)</b>	<b>1411</b>
<b>T</b>		<b>1417</b>
<b>T.1</b>	<b>Tariff Concessions</b>	<b>1417</b>
T.1.1	Article II of the GATT 1994. <i>See also</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Article 4.2 and Footnote 1 (A.1.9–13)	1417
T.1.1A	Relationship between Article II and Article III:2 of the GATT 1994	1422
T.1.2	Interpretation and clarification of Members’ schedules of tariff concessions <i>See also</i> GATS, Schedules, Interpretation of schedules (G.1.2.1)	1427
T.1.3	Relationship between schedules of concessions and the GATT 1994	1432
T.1.4	Relationship between Members’ schedules and the Agreement on Agriculture. <i>See also</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Relationship between the Agreement on Agriculture and the GATT 1994 (A.1.37)	1434
T.1.5	Modification of schedules	1435
<b>T.2</b>	<b>Tariff Quotas – Non-Discriminatory Administration. <i>See also</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Article 4.1 – Market access commitments contained in schedules (A.1.8); Licensing Agreement (L.2); MFN Treatment (M.2); Quantitative Restrictions (Q.1); Waivers (W.1)</b>	<b>1436</b>
<b>T.3</b>	<b>Taxation. <i>See also</i> National treatment, Article III:2 of the GATT 1994, first and second sentences (N.1.2–8)</b>	<b>1441</b>
<b>T.4</b>	<b>TBT Agreement</b>	<b>1442</b>
T.4.0	Object and purpose	1442

T.4.0A	Annex 1 – Terms and their definitions	1443
T.4.1	Annex 1.1 – “technical regulation” definition	1443
T.4.2	Annex 1.2 – Standards	1448
T.4.2A	Article 2.1 – MFN and national treatment obligations	1449
T.4.2A.1	Relationship with corresponding GATT 1994 provisions	1449
T.4.2A.2	General	1450
T.4.2A.3	Burden of proof	1454
T.4.2A.4	“like products”. <i>See also</i> National Treatment, Article III:2 of the GATT 1994, first sentence – “like products” (N.1.3); National Treatment, Article III:4 of the GATT 1994 – Regulatory discrimination (N.1.9); Textiles and Clothing Agreement, Article 6.2 – “like products” (T.7.5)	1455
T.4.2A.5	“treatment no less favourable”. <i>See also</i> MFN Treatment (M.2); National Treatment, Article III:4 of the GATT 1994 – “less favourable treatment” (N.1.11)	1461
T.4.2A.6	Relationship with Article 2.2	1472
T.4.2B	Article 2.2 – Not more trade-restrictive than necessary to fulfill a legitimate objective. <i>See also</i> General Exceptions: Article XX of the GATT 1994, Article XX(a) and (b) – Necessity test (G.3.3A); General Exceptions: Article XX of the GATT 1994, Article XX(d) – Necessity test (G.3.6); General Exceptions: Article XIV of the GATS, Article XIV(a) – Necessity test – Reasonably available alternative (G.4.4)	1473
T.4.2B.1	General/necessity test	1473
T.4.2B.2	Burden of proof	1476
T.4.2B.3	Trade-restrictiveness	1477
T.4.2B.4	Legitimate objective	1478
T.4.2B.5	“to fulfill”	1483
T.4.2B.6	“the risks non-fulfilment would create”	1486
T.4.2B.7	Alternative measures	1486
T.4.3	Article 2.4 – International standards as a basis for technical regulation. <i>See also</i> Burden of Proof, General (B.3.1); Temporal Application of Rights and Obligations, TBT Agreement (T.5.3)	1488
T.4.4	Article 2.4 – “except when such international standards or relevant parts would be an ineffective or inappropriate means”	1496
T.4.5	Article 2.4 – Preparation, adoption and continued application of existing regulations	1497
T.4.6	Article 2.12 – Reasonable interval between publication and entry into force of technical regulations. <i>See also</i> Relevance of Article 2.12 of the TBT Agreement when implementation takes place through a technical regulation (ARB.5.16.2)	1497
<b>T.5</b>	<b>Temporal Application of Rights and Obligations. <i>See also</i> Principles and Concepts of General Public International Law, No retroactive application of treaties (P.3.4); WTO Agreement, Article XVI:4 – WTO-conformity of laws, regulations and administrative procedures (W.4.3)</b>	<b>1501</b>
T.5.1	SCM Agreement	1501
T.5.2	SPS Agreement	1506

	Textiles and Clothing Agreement. <i>See</i> Textiles and Clothing Agreement, Article 6.10 – No backdating of a safeguard (T.7.7)	1506
T.5.3	TBT Agreement. <i>See also</i> TBT Agreement, Article 2.4 – International standards as a basis for technical regulation (T.4.3)	1506
	TRIPS Agreement. <i>See</i> TRIPS Agreement, Article 70 (T.9.11–15)	1506
<b>T.6</b>	<b>Terms of Reference of Panels. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 17.4 – “matter referred to the DSB” (A.3.56); Competence of Panels and the Appellate Body (C.3); Due process, Due process in WTO dispute settlement proceedings (D.2.2); Jurisdiction (J.2); Objections (O.1); Request for the Establishment of a Panel (R.2); Scope of Appellate Review (S.3)</b>	<b>1507</b>
T.6.1	General	1507
T.6.2	Claims and legal basis of the complaint. <i>See also</i> Burden of Proof, General (B.3.1); Claims and Arguments (C.1); Claims and Panel Reasoning (C.2); Enabling Clause (E.1); Judicial Economy (J.1); Jurisdiction (J.2); Request for the Establishment of a Panel, Article 6.2 of the DSU – Claims and legal basis of the complaint (R.2.2)	1518
T.6.3	Specific measures at issue. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 17.3 – Consultations (A.3.55); Burden of Proof (B.3); Jurisdiction (J.2); Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1); Mandatory and Discretionary Legislation (M.1); Request for the Establishment of a Panel, Article 6.2 of the DSU – Specific measures at issue (R.2.3)	1526
T.6.4	“Post suspension of concessions”. <i>See also</i> Suspension of Concessions or Other Obligations (S.9)	1539
	Text. <i>See</i> Interpretation (I.3)	1541
<b>T.7</b>	<b>Textiles and Clothing Agreement</b>	<b>1541</b>
T.7.1	Article 6 – Transitional safeguard. <i>See also</i> Accession Protocols, Transitional safeguard mechanism (A.0.3); Agreement on Agriculture, Article 5 – Special safeguard (A.1.14); Safeguards Agreement (S.1); Safeguards Agreement, Article XIX of the GATT 1994 – General (S.1.45)	1541
T.7.2	Article 6.2 – “determination”	1541
T.7.3	Article 6.2 – “domestic industry”. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 4 – Definition of domestic industry (A.3.27A); Safeguards Agreement, Article 4.1(c) – Domestic industry (S.1.25)	1542
T.7.4	Article 6.2 – “directly competitive products”. <i>See also</i> Directly Competitive or Substitutable Products (D.1); National Treatment, Article III:2 of the GATT 1994, second sentence – “directly competitive or substitutable” products (N.1.6)	1543
T.7.5	Article 6.2 – “like products”. <i>See also</i> National Treatment, Article III:2 of the GATT 1994, first sentence – “like products” (N.1.3); National Treatment, Article III:4 of the GATT 1994 – Regulatory discrimination (N.1.9); Safeguards Agreement, Article 2.1 – “like or directly competitive	



	products” (S.1.3); TBT Agreement, Article 2.1 – MFN and national treatment obligations, “like products” (T.4.2A.4)	1544
T.7.6	Article 6.4 – Attribution of serious damage. <i>See also</i> Principles and Concepts of General Public International Law, Proportionality (P.3.6)	1544
T.7.7	Article 6.10 – No backdating of a safeguard. <i>See also</i> Temporal Application of Rights and Obligations (T.5)	1546
T.7.8	Article 6.11 – Provisional application of a safeguard	1547
<b>T.8</b>	<b>Third Party Rights. <i>See also</i> Amicus Curiae Briefs, Briefs submitted by WTO Members (A.2.2); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 24 – Third participants (W.2.9)</b>	<b>1547</b>
	Trademarks. <i>See</i> Paris Convention (1967), Articles 6(1) and 6 <i>quinquies</i> (P.2.1–2); TRIPS Agreement, Articles 15 and 16 (T.9.3–6)	1549
	Trade Names. <i>See</i> Paris Convention (1967), Article 8 – Trade names (P.2.3); TRIPS Agreement, Article 2.1 – Intellectual property law conventions (T.9.2)	1549
	Transparency. <i>See</i> Business Confidential Information (B.4); Confidentiality (C.6); Inferences Drawn from the Refusal of a Party to Provide Information (I.1); Publication and Administration of Trade Regulations (P.5); Seek Information and Technical Advice (S.4)	1549
	Treaties Incorporated into the TRIPS Agreement. <i>See</i> Paris Convention (1967) (P.2)	1549
<b>T.8A</b>	<b>TRIMs Agreement. <i>See also</i> National Treatment, Article III:8 of the GATT 1994 – Derogations from the National Treatment Obligation (N.1.11A); SCM Agreement, Relationship between the SCM Agreement and the GATT 1994 (S.2.41); SCM Agreement, Article III:8 of the GATT 1994 – Subsidies (S.2.42); SCM Agreement, Relationship between the SCM Agreement and the TRIMs Agreement (S.2.45)</b>	<b>1549</b>
T.8A.1	General	1549
T.8A.2	Article 2.1 and the relationship with the GATT 1994	1550
T.8A.3	Article 2.2, the Illustrative List, and the relationship with the GATT 1994 and the SCM Agreement	1551
T.8A.4	Article 3 – Exceptions	1554
<b>T.9</b>	<b>TRIPS Agreement</b>	<b>1554</b>
T.9.1	Article 1.2 – Definition of “intellectual property”	1554
T.9.2	Article 2.1 – Intellectual property law conventions. <i>See also</i> Paris Convention (1967) (P.2)	1555
	Article 3.1 – National treatment. <i>See</i> National Treatment, Article 3.1 of the TRIPS Agreement (N.1.14)	1556
	Article 4 – MFN treatment. <i>See</i> MFN Treatment, Article 4 of the TRIPS Agreement (M.2.3)	1556
T.9.3	Article 15.1 – Trademarks – Protectable Subject Matter	1556

T.9.4	Article 15.2 – Trademarks – Denial of protection on other grounds. <i>See also</i> Paris Convention (1967) (P.2)	1556
T.9.5	Article 16.1 – Trademarks – Exclusive rights conferred on the owner	1557
T.9.6	Article 16.1 – Trademarks – Determination of ownership	1557
T.9.7	Article 33 – Patents – “term of protection”	1558
T.9.8	Article 33 – Relationship with Article 62.2	1559
T.9.9	Article 33 – Relationship with Article 70.2	1559
T.9.10	Article 42 – Civil and administrative procedures and remedies	1560
T.9.11	Article 70 – Relationship between paragraphs 1 and 2	1562
T.9.12	Article 70.1 – Acts which occurred before the date of TRIPS application	1563
T.9.13	Article 70.2 – Protection of Existing Subject Matter	1564
T.9.14	Article 70.8(a) – Filing of “mailbox” applications	1565
T.9.15	Article 70.9 – Exclusive marketing rights	1565
	<b>V</b>	<b>1566</b>
	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties	1566
	Article 26 – <i>Pacta sunt servanda</i> . <i>See</i> Principles and Concepts of General Public International Law, Good faith – <i>Pacta sunt servanda</i> (P.3.1)	1566
	Article 28 – Non-retroactivity of treaties. <i>See</i> Principles and Concepts of General Public International Law, No retroactive application of treaties (P.3.4); Temporal Application of Rights and Obligations (T.5)	1566
	Article 31. <i>See</i> Interpretation, General rules of treaty interpretation – Article 31 of the Vienna Convention (I.3.1)	1566
	Article 32. <i>See</i> Interpretation, Supplementary means of interpretation – Article 32 of the Vienna Convention (I.3.10)	1566
	Article 33. <i>See</i> Interpretation, Multiple authentic languages – Article 33 of the Vienna Convention (I.3.11)	1566
	<b>W</b>	<b>1567</b>
<b>W.1</b>	<b>Waivers. <i>See also</i> WTO Agreement, Article IX – Decision-making (W.4.1A)</b>	<b>1567</b>
	Withdrawal of an Appeal. <i>See</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 30 – Withdrawal (W.2.13)	1569
<b>W.2</b>	<b>Working Procedures for Appellate Review. <i>See also</i> Due process, Due process in WTO dispute settlement proceedings (D.2.2); Scope of Appellate Review (S.3); Working Procedures for Panels (W.3); Procedural Issues Related to Appellate Proceedings (Annex G)</b>	1569
W.2.0	Timing of an appeal. <i>See also</i> Rule 26 – Working Schedule (W.2.10); Rule 30 – Withdrawal (W.2.13)	1569
W.2.1	General	1570

W.2.2	Rule 3.1 – Decision-making	1571
W.2.3	Rule 3.2 – Concurring opinion – Article 17.11 of the DSU	1571
W.2.3A	Rule 3.2 – Separate opinion – Article 17.11 of the DSU	1573
W.2.4	Rule 8 – Rules of conduct – Confidentiality. <i>See also</i> Business Confidential Information (B.4); Confidentiality (C.6)	1575
W.2.5	Rule 13 – Replacement of Appellate Body Member on Division. <i>See also</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 16 – Process, Rule 16(1) – Adoption of additional procedures (W.2.6.1)	1575
W.2.5A	Rule 15 – Transition	1576
W.2.6	Rule 16 – Process. <i>See also</i> <i>Amicus Curiae</i> Briefs, Additional procedure (A.2.3); Business Confidential Information (B.4); Confidentiality (C.6)	1576
W.2.6.1	Rule 16(1) – Adoption of additional procedures	1576
W.2.6.2	Rule 16(2) – Requests to modify dates and deadlines. <i>See also</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 26 – Working Schedule, Extension of deadline for submissions of participants or third participants (W.2.10.1); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 27 – Oral hearing (W.2.11)	1581
W.2.6A	Rule 18 – Documents	1585
W.2.6A.1	Filing and service of documents	1585
W.2.6A.2	Correction of clerical errors. <i>See also</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 23 <i>bis</i> – Amendments to Notices of Appeal (W.2.8A)	1588
W.2.7	Rule 20 – Notice of Appeal. <i>See also</i> Claims and Arguments (C.1); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 23 – Multiple appeals (cross appeal) (W.2.8)	1590
W.2.7.1	General	1590
W.2.7.2	Content	1592
W.2.7.3	Sufficiency of Notice of Appeal	1593
W.2.7.4	Amendment. <i>See also</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 23 <i>bis</i> – Amendments to Notices of Appeal (W.2.8A); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 30 – Withdrawal, Withdrawal and re-filing of Notice of Appeal (W.2.13.1)	1596
W.2.7.5	Article 11 of the DSU – Allegation of the panel’s failure to objectively assess. <i>See also</i> Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU (S.7.2–9)	1597
W.2.7A	Rule 21 – Appellant’s submission	1600
W.2.7B	Rule 22 – Appellee’s submission. <i>See also</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 23 – Multiple appeals (cross appeal) (W.2.8)	1601
W.2.8	Rule 23 – Multiple appeals (cross appeal). <i>See also</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 20 – Notice of Appeal (W.2.7); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 22 – Appellee’s submission (W.2.7B)	1601
W.2.8A	Rule 23 <i>bis</i> – Amendments to Notices of Appeal. <i>See also</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 18 – Documents, Correction of clerical errors (W.2.6A.2); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 20 – Notice of Appeal, Amendment (W.2.7.4)	1603

W.2.9	Rule 24 – Third participants. <i>See also</i> Third Party Rights (T.8); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 26 – Working Schedule (W.2.10); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 27 – Oral hearing (W.2.11)	1604
W.2.9A	Rule 25 – Transmittal of Record	1609
W.2.10	Rule 26 – Working Schedule. <i>See also</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Timing of an appeal (W.2.0); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 16 – Process, Rule 16(2) – Requests to modify dates and deadlines (W.2.6.2); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 24 – Third participants (W.2.9)	1609
W.2.10.1	Extension of deadline for submissions of participants or third participants. <i>See also</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 16 – Process, Rule 16(2) – Requests to modify dates and deadlines (W.2.6.2)	1609
W.2.10.2	Timing of circulation of Appellate Body report	1612
W.2.11	Rule 27 – Oral hearing. <i>See also</i> Business Confidential Information (B.4); Confidentiality (C.6)	1617
W.2.11.1	Change of date. <i>See also</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 16 – Process, Rule 16(2) – Requests to modify dates and deadlines (W.2.6.2)	1617
W.2.11.2	Joint oral hearing. <i>See also</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 16 – Process, Rule 16(1) – Adoption of additional procedures (W.2.6.1)	1619
W.2.11.3	Open oral hearing. <i>See also</i> Business Confidential Information (B.4); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 16 – Process, Rule 16(1) – Adoption of additional procedures (W.2.6.1)	1619
W.2.11.4	Time-limits for oral arguments	1643
W.2.12	Rule 28 – Written responses	1644
W.2.13	Rule 30 – Withdrawal. <i>See also</i> Timing of an appeal (W.2.0)	1647
W.2.13.1	Withdrawal and re-filing of Notice of Appeal. <i>See also</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 20 – Notice of Appeal, Amendment (W.2.7.4)	1647
W.2.13.2	Withdrawal of appeal Rules of Conduct – Annex II. <i>See</i> Confidentiality (C.6); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 3 (W.2.2–3); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 8 (W.2.4); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 27 – Oral hearing (W.2.11)	1650 1651
<b>W.3</b>	<b>Working Procedures for Panels. <i>See also</i> Prompt Settlement of Disputes – Article 3.3 of the DSU (P.4A)</b>	<b>1651</b>
<b>W.4</b>	<b>WTO Agreement. <i>See also</i> GATT 1994, Language of Annex 1A incorporating the GATT 1994 into the WTO Agreement (G.2.1)</b>	<b>1654</b>
W.4.1	Preamble	1654
W.4.1A	Article IX – Decision-making. <i>See also</i> Interpretation – Subsequent agreement (I.3.9A); Waivers (W.1)	1655
W.4.2	Article XVI:1 – Relevance to GATT 1947 decisions, procedures and customary practices	1658
W.4.3	Article XVI:4 – WTO-conformity of laws, regulations and administrative procedures. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 18.4 – Obligation	

to ensure WTO-conformity of domestic anti-dumping laws, regulations and procedures (A.3.62); Temporal Application of Rights and Obligations (T.5)	1658
<b>Part II Arbitration Awards under Article 21.3(c) of the DSU</b>	<b>1659</b>
<b>ARB.1 Mandate of Arbitrator under Article 21.3(c)</b>	<b>1661</b>
<b>ARB.2 Prompt Compliance</b>	<b>1666</b>
<b>ARB.3 Withdrawal or Modification of the Measure</b>	<b>1670</b>
ARB.3.1 General	1670
ARB.3.2 Panel recommendations	1672
<b>ARB.4 “Reasonable Period of Time”</b>	<b>1673</b>
ARB.4.1 General	1673
ARB.4.2 15-month guideline	1676
ARB.4.3 Shortest period possible within a Member’s legal system	1678
ARB.4.4 Single or multiple period(s) of time?	1683
<b>ARB.5 “Particular Circumstances”</b>	<b>1684</b>
ARB.5.1 General	1684
ARB.5.2 Actions taken since DSB adoption of report(s)	1687
ARB.5.2A Circumstances pre-dating DSB adoption	1690
ARB.5.3 Complexity of implementing measures	1692
ARB.5.4 Complexity of implementation process	1694
ARB.5.5 Relevance of contentiousness	1698
ARB.5.6 Means of implementation	1702
ARB.5.7 Structural adjustment	1713
ARB.5.8 Economic and financial collapse	1714
ARB.5.9 Economic impact of existing measure. <i>See also</i> Relevance of contentiousness (ARB.5.5)	1715
ARB.5.10 Developing countries	1717
ARB.5.11 Calendar of legislative body	1723
ARB.5.12 Flexibility of implementation process	1724
ARB.5.13 Relevance of legislative action on other measures	1727
ARB.5.14 Existence of previous disputes relevant for determination of reasonable period of time	1728
ARB.5.15 Relevance of other non-WTO international obligations	1728
ARB.5.16 Relevance of other WTO obligations	1730
ARB.5.16.1 General	1730
ARB.5.16.2 Relevance of Article 2.12 of the TBT Agreement when implementation takes place through a technical regulation. <i>See also</i> TBT Agreement, Article 2.12 – Reasonable interval between publication and entry into force of technical regulations (T.4.6)	1732
<b>ARB.6 Burden of Proof</b>	<b>1734</b>

---

**Annexes**

Annex A	Terms of Office of Current and Former Appellate Body Members and Chairpersons	1738
Annex B	Biographies of Current and Former Appellate Body Members	1740
Annex C	Information on Appellate Body Reports – 1996 to 2013	1753
Annex D	Arbitration Awards under Article 21.3(c) of the DSU – 1996 to 2013	1775
Annex E	Articles of Covered Agreements Addressed in Appellate Body Reports	1778
Annex F	Working Procedures for Appellate Review WT/AB/WP/6	1801
Annex G	Procedural Issues Related to Appellate Proceedings	1823
	Abbreviations used in the Table of References to the Covered Agreements and Other Instruments and in the Indexes	1832
	Table of References to the Covered Agreements and other Instruments by Article	1833
	Subject Index	1850
	Subject Index by Case (Appellate Body Reports)	1953
	Subject Index by Case (Arbitration Awards under Article 21.3(c) of the DSU)	2115