# CONTENTS

*Foreword*  xii  
*Abbreviations*  xiii  
*Disclaimer*  xv

## 1 Introduction to the WTO Dispute Settlement System  1

- Functions, Objectives and Key Features of the Dispute Settlement System  
  - Providing Security and Predictability to the Multilateral Trading System  5  
  - Preserving the Rights and Obligations of WTO Members under the WTO Agreement  6  
  - Clarification of Rights and Obligations through Interpretation  7  
  - "Mutually Agreed Solution" as "Preferred Solution"  12  
  - Prompt Settlement of Disputes  13  
  - Prohibition against Unilateral Determinations of Violation and Unilateral Actions  15  
  - Exclusive and Compulsory Jurisdiction  16  
  - An Integrated Set of Rules and Procedures  17

## 2 Actors in the WTO Dispute Settlement Process  21

- Parties and Third Parties  21  
  - Parties  21  
  - Third Parties  22  
  - No Direct Access for Non-State Actors  22  
- The Dispute Settlement Body (DSB)  24  
  - Composition and Functions  24  
  - Decision-making in the DSB  24  
  - Role of the DSB Chairperson  26  
- The WTO Secretariat  27  
  - The Director-General of the WTO  27  
  - The WTO Secretariat Staff  28  
  - The WTO Dispute Settlement Registry  29  
- Panels  29  
  - Functions and Composition of Panels  29
Administrative and Legal Support to Panels and Arbitrators 30
Appellate Body 31
The Role of the Appellate Body 31
Composition and Structure of the Appellate Body 32
The Appellate Body Secretariat 33
Arbitrators 34
Experts 35
Rules of Conduct 37

3 The Scope of WTO Disputes 39
When Can a Dispute be Initiated? 39
What Can be Challenged? 40
Measures Attributable to a WTO Member 40
Acts or Omissions 41
Challenges to Measures “As Such” and “As Applied” 42
A Special Case: Anti-Dumping Measures 45
What Claims Can be Raised? 46
The Covered Agreements 46
Violation, Non-violation and Situation Complaints 47

4 The Stages in a Typical WTO Dispute 49
Consultations 50
The Purpose of WTO Consultations 50
Legal Basis and Requirements for a Request for Consultations 51
Procedure for Consultations 54
Third Parties in Consultations 55
Panel Review 57
Introduction 57
Establishment of a Panel 57
The Panel Request 57
Procedures for the Establishment of Panels by the DSB 60
Multiple Complainants: Joint Panels and Separate Panels with
Harmonized Proceedings 61
The Panel’s Terms of Reference 64
Third Parties before the Panel 66
“Substantial Interest” 66
Timing of the Request 67
Third-party Rights 68
Limited Rights Granted by the DSU 68
Enhanced Third-party Rights 69
Panel Composition 71
The Panel Review Process 73
Panel Working Procedures and Timetable for Panel Proceedings 73
Written Submissions 78
Meetings with the Parties 80
General 80
Organizational Meeting 81
Substantive Meetings of the Panel with the Parties 81
Third-party Session 82
Deliberation of the Panel 83
Function of Panels 84
The Panel’s Standard of Review 84
Objective Assessment of the Matter (Article 11 of the DSU) 84
The Special Standard of Review in Article 17.6 of the Anti-Dumping Agreement 88
Judicial Economy 89
Order of Analysis 91
Burden of Proof, Standard of Proof and Rules of Evidence 92
Burden of Proof 92
Standard of Proof 93
Rules of Evidence 94
The Panel’s Right to Seek Information 98
The Panel Report 99
Descriptive Part of the Panel Report 99
Interim Review and Interim Report 100
Findings and Recommendations 101
Issuance and Circulation of the Final Report 103
Panel Reports in Joint Proceedings 103
Appellate Review 104
Applicable Rules and Working Procedures for Appellate Review 104
Scope of Appellate Review 105
Right to Appeal 108
Third Participants at the Appellate Stage 109
Composition of Appellate Body Division 110
Procedures for Appellate Review 111
Notice of Appeal 111
Notice of Other Appeal 114
Written Submissions 114
Oral Hearing 117
Deliberations of the Appellate Body 118
Mandate of the Appellate Body 119
The Appellate Body Report 121
Withdrawal of an Appeal 123
Deadline for Completion of the Appellate Review 124
Adoption of the Reports by the Dispute Settlement Body 125
Legal Effect of Panel and Appellate Body Reports and DSB Recommendations and Rulings 128

5 Compliance with DSB Recommendations and Rulings 130
Prompt Compliance 130
Intentions in Respect of Implementation 131
Reasonable Period of Time for Implementation 132
Compliance Proceedings under Article 21.5 of the DSU 136
Remedies in the Event of Non-implementation 139
  Compensation 139
  Countermeasures (Suspension of Concessions and Other Obligations) 141
    Purpose of Countermeasures under the DSU 141
    Procedure for the Authorization of Suspension of Concessions or Other Obligations 142
    Principles and Procedures Governing the Suspension of Concessions or Other Obligations 143
      Permissible Level of Suspension 144
      Permissible Sector of Countermeasures 144
    Arbitration under Article 22.6 of the DSU 147
    Special Rules on Countermeasures for Prohibited and Actionable Subsidies under the SCM Agreement 150
The “Sequencing” Issue 151
Multilateral Surveillance by the DSB Pending Full Implementation or Satisfaction 152
Special Procedures for Non-violation and Situation Complaints 153
  Non-violation Complaints 153
  Situation Complaints 154

6 Other Procedural Issues Arising in WTO Dispute Settlement Proceedings 155
  Preliminary Rulings 155
  Confidentiality 160
    General Remarks 160
    Confidentiality during Consultations 160
    Confidentiality during Panel Proceedings 161
    Confidentiality during Appellate Review 162
  Legal Representation 162
  Amicus curiae Submissions 163
    Amicus curiae Briefs in Panel Proceedings 164
    Amicus curiae Briefs in Appellate Review 165

7 Alternatives to Adjudication by Panels and the Appellate Body 167
  Mutually Agreed Solutions 167
    Nature of Mutually Agreed Solutions 167
    Legal Effect and Interpretation of Mutually Agreed Solutions 169
    Timing of Negotiations for, and Notification of, Mutually Agreed Solutions 169
  Good Offices, Conciliation and Mediation 171
  Arbitration Pursuant to Article 25 of the DSU 175
8 Developing Countries in the WTO Dispute Settlement System 176

Special and Differential Treatment 176
Special and Differential Treatment during Consultations 176
Special and Differential Treatment at the Panel Stage 176
Special and Differential Treatment at the Implementation Stage 177
Accelerated Procedure – Decision of 5 April 1966 178
Special Dispute Settlement Provisions for Least-developed Country Members 179
Legal Assistance for both Developing and Developed Country Members 180
Representation by External Counsel and the Advisory Centre on WTO Law (ACWL) 181

9 Ongoing Efforts to Improve the WTO Dispute Settlement System 183

Negotiations to Improve and Clarify the DSU 183
Secretariat’s Informal Consultations Concerning the Panel Process 184

10 Further Information and Resources 186

Legal Texts 186
WTO Official Documents 186
Information and Documents on the WTO Website 187
Reference Books 188
Contacting the WTO 189

11 Annex I: Flow Chart of the WTO Dispute Settlement Process 190

12 Annex II: Dispute Settlement Rules 191

Provisions on Consultation and Dispute Settlement in GATT 1994, GATS and the TRIPS Agreement 191
Articles XXII and XXIII of the GATT 1994 191
Articles XXII and XXIII of the GATS 192
Article 64 of the TRIPS Agreement 194
The Understanding on Rules and Procedures Governing the Settlement of Disputes (DSU) 194
Special or Additional Rules and Procedures Contained in the Covered Agreements in Force (Appendix 2 of the DSU) 227
Article 11.2 of the SPS Agreement 227
Articles 14.2 through 14.4 and Annex 2 of the TBT Agreement 227
Articles 17.4 through 17.7 of the Anti-Dumping Agreement 229
Articles 19.3 through 19.5 and Annex II.2(f), 3, 9, 21 of the Customs Valuation Agreement 230
Articles 4.2 through 4.12, 6.6, 7.2 through 7.10, 8.5, 24.4, and 27.7 of the SCM Agreement, footnote 35 thereto, and Annex V thereof
Paragraph 4 of the GATS Annex on Financial Services and Annex on Air Transport Services
Paragraphs 1 through 5 of the Decision on Certain Dispute Settlement Procedures for the General Agreement on Trade in Services
Rules of Conduct for the DSU (WT/DSB/RC/1)

13 Annex III: Examples of Panel Working Procedures
Annex III.B: Sample of Additional Working Procedures for the Protection of Strictly Confidential Information (SCI)
Annex III.C: Sample of Additional Working Procedures for the Protection of Business Confidential Information (BCI)
Annex III.D: Sample of Working Procedures for Article 21.5 Compliance Panel
Annex III.E: Sample of Working Procedures for Article 22.6 Arbitration

14 Annex IV: Examples of Timetables for Panel Proceedings
Annex IV.A: Sample of Timetable for Panel Proceedings (Original Panel Proceedings without Experts)
Annex IV.B: Sample of Timetable for Panel Proceedings (Original Panel Proceedings with Experts)
Annex IV.C: Sample of Timetable for Panel Proceedings (Compliance Panel Proceedings)
Annex IV.D: Sample of Article 22.6 DSU Arbitration Timetable


16 Annex VI: DSB Practices
Working Practices Concerning Dispute Settlement Procedures
United States – Section 306 of the Trade Act and Amendments Thereto

17 Annex VII: Communication from the Director-General on Article 5 of the DSU (WT/DSB/25)

18 Annex VIII: Decision of 5 April 1966 on Procedures under Article XXIII (BISD 14S/18)

20  Annex X: Historic Development of the GATT/WTO Dispute Settlement System 326
The System under the GATT 1947 and its Evolution over the Years 326
   Articles XXII and XXIII of the GATT 1947 and Emerging Practices 326
   Limitations of the GATT Dispute Settlement System 328
   Dispute Settlement under the Tokyo Round “Codes” 330
   The Uruguay Round and the Decision of 1989 on Improvements to GATT Dispute Settlement 330
   Major Changes in the Uruguay Round 331

21  Annex XI: Index of Official Titles and Short Titles of WTO Disputes (as of 1 December 2016) 332

22  Annex XII: WTO Disputes – Reports Circulated and/or Adopted 361

Index 380
FOREWORD

This Handbook explains the rules and procedures of the WTO dispute settlement system, explores the practices that have arisen in its operation since its entry into force on 1 January 1995 and provides a comprehensive account of the existing jurisprudence concerning dispute settlement procedures. It also includes useful information on the operation of the WTO dispute settlement system to date, including tips about notification procedures, templates of working procedures and timetables, timelines of actual disputes, statistical data, etc. The primary purpose of this Handbook is to explain the WTO dispute settlement system to an interested person who may not necessarily have a legal background. With its detailed content and practice-oriented focus, it may also serve as a useful reference tool to experienced practitioners of WTO law, including not only prospective panelists and private counsel but also government officials from WTO members.

In this respect, the term “WTO member” appears in lower case throughout this Handbook, contrary to the capitalization of the term “WTO Member” as a matter of consistent usage throughout the WTO Agreement, including the DSU, and all panel and Appellate Body reports. The lower case is used in this Handbook to be consistent with the editorial style adopted by Cambridge University Press for CUP/WTO co-publications. For correct legal usage in other contexts, including in official WTO dispute settlement practice, the term “WTO Member” should be capitalized.

This second edition of the Handbook has been updated by a team of dispute settlement lawyers from the WTO Secretariat, including Rambod Behboodi, Tania Parcero Herrera, Ruxton McClure and Matthew D’Orsi, under the direction of Maria J. Pereyra. Special thanks should be given to many other colleagues from the Legal Affairs Division, the Appellate Body Secretariat, the Rules Division and the Information and External Relations Division who have assisted in researching, drafting, editing, proofreading and designing this publication.