

**MULTILATERAL TRADE
NEGOTIATIONS
THE URUGUAY ROUND**

RESTRICTED

MTN.TNC/18(MIN)
18 December 1990
Special Distribution

Trade Negotiations Committee

MEETING AT MINISTERIAL LEVEL

Parc des Expositions, Brussels, 3 - 7 December 1990

The Trade Negotiations Committee held its fourteenth meeting at Ministerial level, under the Chairmanship of Dr. Hector Gros Espiell, Minister of Foreign Affairs of Uruguay.

Opening session of the Ministerial meeting, 3 December 1990 at 10 a.m.

The Chairman called the meeting to order and, in the presence of H.M. King Baudouin, introduced Mr. Robert Urbain, Minister of Foreign Trade of Belgium, who delivered an address (MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/1).

The Chairman thanked Mr. Robert Urbain and introduced Mr. Wilfried Martens, Prime Minister of Belgium, who delivered an address (MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/2).

The Chairman thanked Mr. Wilfried Martens and introduced Mr. Jacques Delors, President of the Commission of the European Communities, who delivered an address (MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/3).

The Chairman thanked Mr. Jacques Delors and delivered his opening address (MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/4).

The Chairman then declared the opening session of the Ministerial meeting closed, and, with Mr. Urbain and Mr. Dunkel, accompanied the King as he left the building.

First session of the Trade Negotiations Committee (TNC) meeting,
3 December 1990 at 11.00 a.m.

The agenda, as contained in the airgram convening the meeting (GATT/AIR/3146), was adopted.

Action on the report by the TNC at Officials level

The Chairman called on Mr. Arthur Dunkel (Chairman of the TNC at Officials level) to introduce the report (MTN.TNC/W/35/Rev.1).

Mr. Dunkel expressed his personal pleasure in seeing Dr. Gros Espiell in the chair, as the successor of Minister Ricardo Zerbino. His presence demonstrated once again the commitment of Uruguay to the Round. He

recalled the moment when, four years earlier, Mr. Enrique Iglesias, the then Foreign Minister of Uruguay, banged his gavel in Punta del Este to register agreement on the Ministerial Declaration which launched the Uruguay Round. At that very moment, a number of those present had asked themselves if the four-year period that governments had provided for the conclusion of the negotiations was not, in fact, too long. And with good reason. They had wondered whether the business community - the traders, manufacturers, farmers, investors, service operators, inventors, producers - and the consumers of the world could reasonably be expected to wait for four years before governments agreed on further market opening, on what the future rules of international competition should be, on whether or not there should be multilateral rules to govern trade in sectors, old or new, where none existed now. Since then, a number of far-reaching developments had occurred. These had given a new dimension to the objectives set four years earlier and raised yet another fundamental question: could a strengthened, truly multilateral and open trading system be put in place to serve as a reference point for the dramatic reforms underway in Latin America, Asia, Africa and Central and Eastern Europe, reforms to which Chairman Gros Espiell had referred earlier? The four years that had elapsed since the launching of the Round had been well spent though not, perhaps, as well as might have been hoped. It might have been possible to do better so that these days in Brussels could have been spent celebrating rather than having to face very hard decisions under the pressure of time.

The best he could say was that there was a report by the Chairman of the Trade Negotiations Committee at Officials level giving a picture of the present state of play in the negotiations. He asked the Committee to take note of the following points while considering the report:

- (1) Participants had in their grasp all the ingredients necessary for a substantial package of results. In this sense the report was an impressive document.
- (2) The report also highlighted the points on which even the best drafters and technicians could not offer solutions without political guidance and breakthroughs. In Brussels, therefore, the Ministers would clearly have to take their responsibilities if the work of four years were not to be lost.
- (3) The report covered all subjects which the Ministerial meeting of the TNC would have to consider but was accompanied by: (i) the report of the Chairman of the Surveillance Body; (ii) the communications which participants wished to place before this meeting; and (iii) the note on the TNC meeting at Officials level on Monday, 26 November 1990 (MTN.TNC/17). A list of these documents was to be found in MTN.TNC/W/46. Participants wishing to circulate further communications in writing were, of course, free to do so.

- (4) Even if the cover note to the report did not make it explicit, it was understood that no part of the report could be considered as being agreed before all parts were agreed.
- (5) Since the report was self-explanatory, he did not think it would help the search for consensus to draw attention to the fact that in three areas it had not been possible to develop texts which could serve as an agreed basis for negotiations. These were agriculture, trade-related investment measures and anti-dumping action.
- (6) Even where texts existed - in many cases, very detailed texts, as in rules of origin, textiles and clothing, subsidies and countervailing duties, trade-related intellectual property rights, safeguards and services to name but a few - key political decisions were needed to complete the work. The commentaries attached to the texts listed the main points which had blocked further work. Furthermore, a number of governments had submitted specific comments on some of these texts and they were to be found in the MTN.TNC/W/- series.

The following statements were made:

CANADA	The Honourable John C. Crosbie, Minister for International Trade	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/3
COMMISSION OF THE EUROPEAN COMMUNITIES	Mr. Frans Andriessen, Vice-President of the European Commission	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/4
ASEAN	H.E. Dr. Arifin M. Siregar, Minister of Trade of Indonesia	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/1
SWEDEN	Ms. Anita Gradin, Minister for Foreign Trade	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/5
SINGAPORE	Mr. Mah Bow Tan, Minister of State for Trade and Industry	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/8
PAKISTAN	Mr. Malik Muhammad Naeem Khan, Minister for Commerce	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/9 and Corr.1
COUNCIL OF THE EUROPEAN COMMUNITIES	Mr. Renato Ruggiero, Minister for Foreign Trade of Italy, Presidency of the Council	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/10
COLOMBIA	Dr. Ernesto Sanper Pizano, Minister of Economic Development	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/11
BELGIUM	Mr. Robert Urbain, Minister for Foreign Trade	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/2
FRANCE	Mr. Jean-Marie Rausch, Minister of Foreign Trade	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/12

URUGUAY	Mr. Alvaro Ramos, Minister for Livestock, Agriculture and Fisheries	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/15
JAPAN	Dr. Taro Nakayama, Minister for Foreign Affairs	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/14
SWITZERLAND	Mr. Jean-Pascal Delamuraz, Federal Counsellor, Head of the Department of Public Economy	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/13

Second session of the TNC meeting, 3 December 1990 at 3 p.m.

Chair: Dr. Hector Gros Espiell (Uruguay) - for the first six statements
The Honourable Charles Mayer (Canada) - for the remaining
statements

Action on the report by the TNC at Officials level (continued)

AUSTRALIA	Hon. Mr. Neal Blewett, Minister for Trade Negotiations	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/22
FINLAND	H.E. Mr. Pertti Salolainen, Minister of Foreign Trade	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/16
GREECE	H.E. Mr. Sotirios Hatzigakis, Alternate Minister of Trade	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/23
UNITED STATES	Ambassador Carla A. Hills, United States Trade Representative	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/24
ROMANIA	H.E. Mr. Constantin Fota, Minister for Commerce and Tourism	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/25
NEW ZEALAND	Hon. Mr. Philip Burdon, Minister for Trade Negotiations	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/17
THAILAND	H.E. Mr. Amaret Sila-on, Minister of Commerce	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/18
ISRAEL	Mr. Moshe Nissim, Deputy Prime Minister and Minister of Industry and Trade	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/26

CHILE	H.E. Mr. Carlos Ominami, Minister of the Economy	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/28
POLAND	H.E. Mr. Marcin Swiecicki, Minister for External Economic Relations	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/59
ARGENTINA	Mr. Domingo F. Cavallo, Minister for Foreign Affairs	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/30
HONG KONG	Mr. John Chan, Secretary for Trade and Industry	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/19
ICELAND	Mr. Stefan Fridfinnsson, Assistant Minister for Foreign Affairs and External Trade	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/27
HUNGARY	Dr. Béla Kadar, Minister of International Economic Relations	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/21
NORWAY	Ms. Eldrid Nordbo, Minister of Trade	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/31
PHILIPPINES	H.E. Mr. Jose S. Concepcion, Jr., Secretary of Trade and Industry	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/29
TURKEY	H.E. Mr. Günes Taner, Minister of State	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/20
UNITED NATIONS	The Secretary-General (read by Mr. Antoine Blanca, Director-General of Development and International Economic Co-operation)	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/6
FIJI ¹	The Honourable Berenado Vunibobo, CBE, Minister for Trade and Commerce	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/32

Third session of the TNC meeting, 4 December 1990 at 10.30 a.m.

Chair: H.E. Mr. Georges Solofoson (Madagascar) - for the first nine
statements

Ms. Eldrid Nordbo (Norway) - for the remaining statements

¹Written statement only

Action on the report by the TNC at Officials level (continued)

AFRICAN COUNTRIES	H.E. Mr. Georges Solofoson, Minister for Trade of Madagascar, spokesman for the African countries	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/33
NIGERIA	Hon. Mr. Senas J. Ukpanah, Minister of Trade and Tourism	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/34
MALAYSIA	H.E. Dato' Seri Rafidah Aziz, Minister of International Trade and Industry	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/35
REP. OF KOREA	H.E. Dr. Pil Soo Park, Minister of Trade and Industry	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/36
SRI LANKA	Hon. A.R. Munsoor, Minister of Trade and Commerce (read by H.E. Mr. T.D.S.A. Dissanayaka, Ambassador in Brussels)	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/40
CZECH & SLOVAK F.R.	H.E. Mr. Vladimír Dlouhy, Minister of Economy	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/42
BRAZIL	H.E. Mr. Marcos Castrioto de Azambuja, Special Representative of the President of the Republic, General Secretary for Foreign Policy	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/38
GHANA	H.E. Mr. Huudu Yahaya, PNDC Secretary for Trade and Tourism	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/41
INTERNATIONAL MONETARY FUND	Mr. Michel Camdessus, Managing Director	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/39
TUNISIA	Monsieur M. Mouldi Zouaoui, Secretary of State for Industry and Trade	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/43
INDIA	Dr. Subramanian Swamy, Union Minister of Commerce, Law and Justice	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/46
NETHERLANDS	Ms. Yvonne C.M.T. van Rooy, Minister for Foreign Trade	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/45
JAMAICA	The Honourable David Coore, Q.C., Minister of Foreign Affairs and Foreign Trade	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/47

UNITED KINGDOM

Mr. Peter Lilley, Secretary of State for Trade and Industry MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/44

Fourth session of the TNC meeting, 4 December 1990 at 3 p.m.Chair: The Honourable Charles Mayer (Canada) - for the first nine statements

Mr. Wolfgang Schüssel (Austria) - for the remaining statements

Action on the report by the TNC at Officials level (continued)

KENYA	H.E. Mr. Francis K. Muthaura, Ambassador in Brussels	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/48
GERMANY	Mr. Helmut Haussmann, Federal Minister for Economic Affairs	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/51
INDONESIA	H.E. Dr. Arifin M. Siregar, Minister of Trade	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/49
PERU	H.E. Dr. Guido Pennano, Minister of Industry, Trade, Tourism and Integration	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/50
ZIMBABWE	The Honourable K.M. Kangai, Minister of Industry and Commerce	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/57
AUSTRIA	Mr. Wolfgang Schüssel, Federal Minister for Economic Affairs	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/52
CHINA	H.E. Mr. Shen Jueren, Vice Minister of Foreign Economic Relations and Trade	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/53
BANGLADESH	H.E. Mr. M. Mokammel Haque, Secretary: Ministry of Commerce	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/37
JAPAN	H.E. Mr. Kabun Muto, Minister of International Trade and Industry	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/54
YUGOSLAVIA	Mr. Boran Karadzole, Deputy Federal Secretary for External Economic Relations	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/55
WORLD BANK	Mr. Wilfried Thalwitz, Senior Vice-President, Policy, Research and External Affairs	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/60

TRINIDAD & TOBAGO	Dr. Sahadeo Basdeo, Minister of External Affairs and International Trade	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/56
UNITED NATIONS CONFERENCE ON TRADE AND DEVELOPMENT	Mr. K.K.S. Dadzie, Secretary-General	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/7

Fifth session of the TNC meeting, 5 December 1990 at 10 a.m.

Chair: Mr. Boran Karadzole (Yugoslavia)

Action on the report by the TNC at Officials level (continued)

EGYPT	H.E. Dr. Yousri Mostafa, Minister of Economy and Foreign Trade	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/61
DENMARK	Mr. Jorgen Orstrom Moller, Secretary of State for Foreign Economic Affairs	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/62
SPAIN	H.E. Mr. Apolonio Ruiz Ligerio, Secretary of State for Trade	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/58
VENEZUELA	H.E. Mr. Reinaldo Figueredo Planchart, Minister for Foreign Affairs	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/63
PORTUGAL	Mr. Fernando Faria de Oliveira, Minister of Trade and Tourism	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/65
KUWAIT	H.E. Mr. Ahmad A. Al-Ebrahim, Ambassador in Brussels	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/64
LUXEMBOURG	Mr. G. Wohlfart, Secretary of State for Foreign Affairs	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/74
MAURITIUS	H.E. Mr. Raymond Chasle, Permanent Representative to GATT	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/66
EL SALVADOR	Mrs. Ana Cristina Sol, Ambassador in Belgium	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/67

Sixth session of the TNC meeting, 5 December 1990 at 3.45 p.m.

Chair: Mr. Stuart Robinson (GATT secretariat)

Action on the report by the TNC at officials level (continued)

IRELAND	Mr. Desmond O'Malley, T.D., Minister for Industry and Commerce	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/68
NICARAGUA	Mr. Noel Sacasa, Executive Adviser to the Minister of Economy and Development	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/69
MALAWI	Hon. R.W. Chirwa, Minister of Trade, Industry and Tourism	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/70
CUBA	H.E. Mr. Alberto Betancourt Roa, Deputy Minister of Foreign Trade	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/71
BOLIVIA	Mr. Guido Cespedes Argandoña, Minister of Industry, Trade and Tourism	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/72
ZAIRE	Mr. Buketi Bukayi, Minister for International Co-operation	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/73

Seventh session of the TNC meeting, 6 December 1990 at 11.30 a.m.

Chair: Mr. Stuart Robinson (GATT secretariat)

Action on the report by the TNC at officials level (continued)

SENEGAL	H.E. Mr. Alioune Sene, Ambassador, Permanent Representative to the United Nations Office at Geneva	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/75
HONDURAS	Mr. Mario Agüero Lacayo, Deputy Minister for Economic Affairs and Trade	MTN.TNC/MIN(90)/ST/76

Eighth session of the TNC meeting, 7 December 1990 at 2 p.m.

Chair: Dr. Hector Gros Espiell (Uruguay)

Action on the report by the TNC at Officials level (continued)

The Chairman made the following statement:

"1. Our Brussels meeting has made a substantial contribution to advancing the negotiating process. I have nevertheless reached the conclusion that participants need more time to reconsider and reconcile their positions in some key areas of the negotiations. We are, therefore, not in a position

to conclude the Uruguay Round during this Brussels Ministerial Meeting. More time is also needed to ensure that the positions of all participants in the negotiations are fully taken into account, in accordance with the multilateral character of the negotiations. We shall deploy our best efforts in undertaking this task.

"In doing so, we are mindful of the need to conduct an effective evaluation of the extent to which the objectives relating to differential and more favourable treatment for developing countries are being attained.

"2. I therefore propose that Mr. Dunkel, in his capacity as Chairman of the TNC at Official level be requested to pursue intensive consultations in the period from now until the beginning of next year with the specific objective of achieving agreements in all the areas of the negotiating programme in which differences remain outstanding.

"For my part, I remain at the disposal of participants in the consultations and shall be in constant, daily contact with Mr. Dunkel.

"3. During the period in which Mr. Dunkel is conducting consultations, the TNC may be convened at any time at short notice. We request Mr. Dunkel to reconvene the TNC at the appropriate level to conclude the negotiations at the date he considers appropriate in the light of his consultations.

"4. Mr. Dunkel and I will remain in close contact throughout this process.

"5. The consultations Mr. Dunkel is to conduct will be based on the draft Final Act embodying the results of the Uruguay Round Multilateral Trade Negotiations which was submitted to the Ministerial Meeting of the TNC in Brussels (document MTN.TNC/W/35/Rev.1, dated 3 December 1990), including the cover page which refers to the Surveillance Body and the communications which various participants have sent to Brussels. Naturally, Mr. Dunkel will also take duly into account the considerable amount of work carried out during our Brussels meeting, although it does not commit any delegation. In this connection I should like to thank the Ministers who have helped me so efficiently during the past days in Brussels, namely Mr. Hassan Abouyoub, Dato' Seri Rafidah Aziz, Mr. John Crosbie, Mrs. Anita Gradin, Mr. Mats Hellstrom, Mrs. Yvonne van Rooy and Mr. Jaime Serra Puche.

"6. We wish Mr. Dunkel luck and reaffirm our determination to ensure that, with the extension of the Uruguay Round for a brief period following the Brussels conference, results will be achieved that will be significant for all participants."

The Committee took note of this statement and of the statements made in the previous sessions.